# **Reaching out to Bridge the Gap**

Exploring alternative strategies and interventions for girls education in village Bakhar Jamali, Sindh Province.

A Research project submitted to Larenstein University of Applied Sciences In partial fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Management of Development, specialization Social Inclusion, Gender and Livelihood

By Asim Qadri September 2008,

Wageningen The Netherlands © Copyright Asim Qadri, 2008. All rights reserved

## PERMISSION TO USE

In presenting this research project in partial fulfilment of the requirements for Postgraduate degree, I agree that the library of this University may make it freely available for inspection. I further agree that permission for copying of this research project in any manner, in whole or in part, for scholarly purposes may be granted by Larenstein Director of Research. It is understood that any copying or publication or use of this research project or parts thereof for financial gain shall not e allowed without my written permission. It is also understood that due recognition shall be given to me and to the University in any scholarly use which may be made of any material in my research project.

Requests for permission to copy or to make other use of material in this research project in whole or part should be addressed to:

Director Research Larenstein University of Applied Sciences P.O.Box 9001 6880 GB Velp The Netherlands Fax: 31 26 3615287

The researcher can be contacted at: <a href="mailto:asimdj@hotmail.com">asimdj@hotmail.com</a>

# ABSTRACT

Progress and prosperity of a country, largely depends on the choices of education made available its people. Indeed, education is one of the most powerful instruments of change. Its importance achieving national goals through producing young minds imbued with knowledge, attitudes, skills, and competencies to shape the future destiny of the nation has been fully recognized by the Government, Education is a powerful subject under the 1973 Constitution.

Literacy is an important and fundamental indicator of education imperative to have an impact in the long run on welfare and wellbeing of people. The literacy rate remained very low in Pakistan in the past. It was 26% in 1982, 45% in 1998 census and rose to 55% in Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement (PSLM), Survey 2004 – 05. However, the urban / rural and male / female differentials are still higher in urban (72%) compared to rural (47%) while female differentials are significantly different in males in rural 57% compared to 18% for females in Sindh. The female literacy rate at 14% in rural and 38% in urban in Sindh is a matter of concern,

The most rural societies in Pakistan are patriarchal. In these societies men own land, animals and women. In these marginalized areas, girls still do not enjoy their right to basic education. The regions are characterized by poverty and particular aspects of gender inequalities. There is little opportunity for parents to send their children to schools and when it is there, they usually send boys to schools. However, in Pakistan especially in Sindh province, there is inadequate focus on educating both sexes. The different life chances of both boys and girls are not well addressed towards achieving equality. Hence, girls access less education than boys, and their participation and achievements are much lower, than those of boys.

Both girls and boys have various and distinct life challenges. The challenge for girls might be domestic work load, early marriages, violence against women, religious and cultural barriers, lack of girl –friendly environment (such as lack of sanitation), and lack of model female teacher in the schools might not influence the schooling success for boys. The challenges to boys might not apply for girls. However, educational programmes / strategies fail to recognize such different challenges and apply the same procedure for both sexes and also the same in rural and urban setting to meet equality.

To provide equal opportunities in education for the disadvantaged groups such as girls and women, equal distribution of resources may not be sufficient to reach their full potential; therefore, appropriate strategies / interventions are necessary to be explored and implemented.

Fatima Memorial Educational Welfare Society (FMEWS) is a Non Governmental Organization (NGO), working with the main objective being promotion of education for girls in rural areas and also the researcher's organization. It has actively been involved in promoting education in remote and rural areas of Sindh, Province of Pakistan. Overall, equal opportunities of education for both boys and girls are the major focus of the organization. However, girls being the most disadvantage and marginalized group are given special attention in terms of fee waivers, providing free books and school uniforms and information technology (IT) trainings. The FMEWS has also established one formal school at village Bakhar Jamali. This study was being carried out for this organization as problem owner and the village Bakhar Jamali was taken as the target area.

Even though there is special attention is given to encourage the girls participation, in formal and non –formal education, girls low participation have been observed due to higher gender gap in this area. The objective of this research was to identify the constraints in the participation of girls in educational programmes initiated by the Society and make it more participatory. The outcome of this finding will contribute in making policies and strategies of the society educational projects and strengthen the gender equality program which has been already addressed by equal opportunities, so that it will help to promote gender equity in education.

## **DEFINITIONS OF CONCEPTS**

**Affirmative Actions:** Actions taken on a temporary basis in favour of a disadvantaged group so as to enhance equity.

**Basic Education:** Refers to primary and secondary education or its equivalence.

Curriculum: Refers to the content of an education programme.

**Empowerment:** A process through which men, women, boys and girls acquire knowledge and skills, and develop attitudes to critically analyze their situations and take appropriate actions to improve their status or that of the marginalized groups in society.

**Engender:** The process of ensuring that planning and programming is appreciative of and takes into account gender differences and concerns.

**Gender:** This refers to the socially determined power relations, roles, responsibilities and entitlements for men and women; girls and boys.

**Gender analysis:** the process of examining the roles, responsibilities, or any other aspects, with regard to women and men; boys and girls, with a view to identifying gaps, raising concerns and addressing them; investigating and identifying specific needs of girls and boys, women and men for policy and programme development and implementation.

**Gender Discrimination:** Refers to unequal or preferential treatment to individuals or groups based on their gender that result into reduced access to or control of resources and opportunities.

**Gender equality:** Refers to equal treatment of women and men; boys and girls so that they can enjoy the benefits of development including equal access to and control of opportunities and resources.

**Gender Equity:** Refers to the practice of fairness and justice in the distribution of benefits, access to and control of resources, responsibilities, power, opportunities and services. It is essential, the elimination of all forms of discrimination based on gender.

**Gender Mainstreaming:** This is consistent integration of gender concerns into the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies, plans, programmes, activities and projects, at all levels.

**Gender Parity:** This is a numerical concept referring to equal number of girls and women, boys and men relative to their respective numbers in the population.

**Gender responsive pedagogy:** Refers to teaching and learning methodologies, and classroom practices that take gender into consideration.

**Gender roles:** These are socially assigned roles and responsibilities as opposed to biologically determined functions.

**Gender sensitization:** The process of developing people's awareness, knowledge and skills on gender issues.

**Gender stereotyping:** assigning of roles, tasks and responsibilities to men and women, boys and girls on the basis of preconceived prejudices.

**Gender transformative:** A policy that takes into account the needs of men, women, boys and girls. Such a policy seeks to transform the existing gender relations to be more equitable through the redistribution of resources and responsibilities.

**Gross enrolment rate:** The number of pupils or students enrolled in a given level of education, regardless of age, expressed as a percentage of the population in the theoretical age group for the same level of education.

**Net enrolment rate:** Number of pupils in the theoretical age group for a given level of education enrolled in that level expressed as a percentage of the total population in that group.

**Patriarchy:** It means "Rule of Father" and refers to male dominated social relations, ownership and control of power at many levels in society. It is thought to be the root cause of the existing system of gender discrimination.

**Participation:** A general term used to refer to active involvement in enrolment, retention, progression, performance and transition.

**Provisions**; Refers to policy pronouncements on action to be taken or the resources provided.

**Sex disaggregated data:** Classification of information on the basis of sex; that is male or female.

**Gender-based violence:** Refers to violence meted out to people belonging to a given gender.

**Sexual Harassment:** Unwelcome acts of a sexual nature that cause discomfort to the targeted person. These include words, persistent request for sexual favours, gestures, touch, suggestions, coerced sexual intercourse and rape.

**Strategic interests:** Refer to long term non material needs. These are focused on getting more choices, more options and more say.

# **CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION**

This study is based on the observation that progress and prosperity of a country largely depends on the choices of education made available to its people. Indeed, education is one of the most powerful instruments for change. Its importance in achieving national goals through producing young minds imbued with knowledge, attitudes, skills, and competencies to shape the future destiny of the nation has been fully recognized.

Literacy is an important and fundamental indicator of education imperative to have an impact in the long run on welfare and wellbeing of people. The literacy rate remained very low in Pakistan in the past. It was 26% in 1982, 45% in 1998 census and rose to 55% in Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement (PSLM), Survey 2004 – 05. However, the urban / rural and male / female differentials are still higher in urban (72%) compared to rural (47%) while female differentials are significantly different in males in rural 57% compared to 18% for females in Sindh.

	10 Yea	rs & more	Adul	t Literacy	Rate (15	vears & Ol
	Boys	Girls	Both	Male	Female	Both
Urban	80	63	72	78	59	69
Punjab	81	67	74	77	62	70
Sindh	80	62	72	80	59	70
NWFP	80	49	65	74	42	58
Balochistan	74	41	59	72	35	55
Rural	62	31	47	56	24	40
Punjab	64	38	51	56	30	43
Sindh	57	18	39	54	14	36
NWFP	66	25	45	58	18	37
Balochistan	47	13	32	44	09	28
Overall	68	42	55	63	36	50
Punjab	69	47	58	63	40	52
Sindh	69	41	56	68	38	54
NWFP	69	29	48	61	22	40
Balochistan	52	18	37	49	14	33

Table 1.1: Literacy levels PSLM, (2004-05)

Source: *PSLM 2004 – 2005* 

The female literacy rate at 14% in rural and 38% in urban in Sindh is a matter of concern, it is in this context that the researcher is endeavouring to explore the reasons for such a low level of literacy and slow progress on this important indicator in Sindh, Pakistan.

Among several affirmative actions taken in Pakistan to improve socio-economic conditions of the country, most predominately are to improve literacy in rural areas particularly female literacy in Pakistan, the Social Action Programme (SAP) is worth mentioning. The SAP incorporates ambitious new targets for broad based Social Development.

The SAP was designed by the Government of Pakistan basically in social sectors with emphasis on education of girls and to promote in the following two areas:

- Social Sector Programme: to promote basic education, primary healthcare, nutrition, population welfare, water supply and sanitation.
- Social Groups: Most importantly are rural people, the urban poor, mothers, infants, and pre-school children's primary school age children.

In addition to government efforts, the NGOs are also working to improve the socioeconomic situation with more emphasis on health and education of females in Sindh. Some of the interventions have been experimented in selected urban areas with satisfactory results but the process in rural areas is still slow due to prevailing socio – economic and cultural barriers in rural Sindh.

The most rural societies in Pakistan are patriarchal. In these societies men own land, animals and women. In these marginalized areas, girls still do not enjoy their right to basic education. The regions are characterized by poverty and particular aspects of gender inequalities. There is little opportunity for parents to send their children to schools and when it is there, they usually send boys to schools. However, in Pakistan especially in Sindh province, there is inadequate focus on educating both sexes. The different life chances of both boys and girls are not well addressed towards achieving equality. Hence, girls access less education than boys, and their participation and achievements are much lower, than those of boys.

Both girls and boys have various and distinct life challenges. The challenge for girls might be domestic work load, early marriages, violence against women, religious and cultural barriers, lack of girl –friendly environment (such as lack of sanitation), and lack of model female teacher in the schools might not influence the schooling success for boys. The challenges to boys might not apply for girls. However, educational programmes / strategies fail to recognize such different challenges and apply the same procedure for both sexes and also the same in rural and urban setting to meet equality.

To provide equal opportunities in education for the disadvantaged groups such as girls and women, equal distribution of resources may not be sufficient to reach their full potential; therefore, appropriate strategies / interventions are necessary to be explored and implemented.

There are also little initiatives from government agencies to develop a gender analysis and identify the obstacles and inequalities faced by this disadvantaged group, both inside and outside of the school. Although providing more schools may increase the overall numbers of children who have access to education, but this does not necessarily address the need of girls and make sure that they will come to schools, and it does not confront the problem of how to support girls to remain in school until they have achieved a good-quality education which can improve their capabilities.

Fatima Memorial Educational Welfare Society (FMEWS) is a Non Governmental Organization (NGO), working with the main objective being promotion of education for girls in rural areas and also the researcher's organization. It has actively been involved in promoting education in remote and rural areas of Sindh, Province of Pakistan. Overall, equal opportunities of education for both boys and girls are the major focus of the organization. However, girls being the most disadvantage and marginalized group are

given special attention in terms of fee waivers, providing free books and school uniforms and information technology (IT) trainings. The FMEWS has also established one formal school at village Bakhar Jamali. This study was being carried out for this organization as problem owner and the village Bakhar Jamali was taken as the target area.

## 1.1 Problem Statement

Fatima Memorial Educational welfare society is concerned about the low enrolment rate and high drop out of girls from the schools. It has failed to come up with specific interventions / strategies / approaches which can be put in place to address the needs and interest of girls to get and keep them in the school. Education for girls is still about parity-equal number of boys and girls. Girls and women are the most disadvantaged group in the rural slums because of traditional norms, values and culture. The different interests and challenges of both boys and girls concerning the achievement of this parity are not well examined and addressed in Sindh province. It is needed to reach out and look how to get and keep the girls in schools by identifying the factors and analyze them to implement appropriate interventions so that they can enjoy their right to be educated.

## 1.2 Research Objective:

The objective of the proposed study is to "explore the factors behind the low enrolment and dropout rate of girls in the schools in village Bakhar Jamali. The output of the study will contribute to implement appropriate alternative / strategies / approaches to bridge the gap."

## 1.3 Research questions:

## a) Main Research Question

• What are the appropriate alternative / strategies / approaches that can be intervened by FMEWS for girl's education in Village Bakhar Jamali?

## b) Sub Questions:

- What are the socio economic facts influencing the girls to get primary and secondary education in the village Bakhar Jamali?
- What are the educational needs and interests of the girls in rural slums of Sindh?
- How do schools address the diverse interests of boys and girls to increase attendance, participation and achievement?
- What are the existing forms of schooling available for the girls in village Bakhar Jamali?
- What is the role of GO's and NGO's in education of girls?
- What restricts the institutions from going beyond formal schooling that can help educate girl child? (Organizational Limitations, rules / regulations etc.)

# **CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW**

## 2.1 Conceptual Base of Education:

According to Siddiqui (1990), Education is a process of nourishing a child or young person. Education is a process of training and developing knowledge, skill and character, etc. Education is essentially a social activity which interacts with society in two ways. Firstly, it receives support and assistance from the society to sustain its programmes, and secondly it endeavours to reform and improve. Moreover, Coombs and Ahmed (1973) stated that education embraces much over than the conventional academic skills and subject matter. It also includes the acquisition of occupational and household skills (commonly called "training"), the development of aesthetic taste and analytical modes of thinking, the formation of attitudes, values and aspirations, the assimilation of pertinent knowledge and information of many sorts.

## 2.1.1 Importance of Education:

Education is essential for every nation. Each nation prospers or declines depending upon the education of its children. Civil, religious, political, legislative, judicial and economic reforms continue only through education. Education is not intellectual development alone that governs individual, national and global progress. It is unleashing of individual potential in all its varied manifestations that does so. The real education is unlocking of potential, and that potential can be released only as the school addresses that individual from that perspective of the whole person. That whole includes mental physical emotional social creative moral and spiritual dimensions of every child. The dimensions are not discrete. And within every individual some facets are more highly developed that others are. Development here is always individual. It is an ongoing life process. Foundations for the growth begin in the home and reinforced in the school. Growth beyond that continues only through individual initiative (Kelsey, 1993).

## 2.1.2 Primary and secondary Education:

According to a general definition of UNESCO, it belongs to an amorphous zone that lies between basic education and higher education. Secondary education is a step for pupils between the ages of 5 and 18 (5 – 12 years, primary education and 12 – 18 years, secondary education). At this level, pupils are expected to broaden their knowledge and experiences from the basic level and prepare for work or higher education.

It is widely recognized that primary and secondary education has functions other than preparing students for higher education. In order to enable basic education to play such a role, there is a need to create suitable educational environments, renew educational methods and contents, and modify the traditional structures of basic schooling. As contemporary societies become more complex, the scope of what constitutes basic education tends to become broader; it is increasingly deemed to cover the lower stages of general secondary education.

General basic education has an enormous impact on the critical period of adolescence, when important life choices for the future and career orientations are made. Its expansion contributes to poverty alleviation. In many countries access to basic education is inequitable, particularly for girls (UNESCO, n.d).

## 2.1.3 Formal System of Education:

Coombs and Ahmed (1973) stated that by formal education, we refer or course to the hierarchically structured, graded "educational system", running from primary school through the university and including in addition to general academic studies, a variety of specialized programmes and institutions for all technical professional training.

Formal education means organization of education through institutional infrastructure like schools, collages and universities, etc. It involves sequential learning structure, which are graded and standardized leading to certification to achieve predetermined objectives in terms of some desirable changes in learners (UNESCO, 1986).

The formal educational system is highly structured with little possibility for student's movement in vertical or horizontal direction. In addition, there are problems of mismatch between the provisions in educational system and the developmental needs of society. This results in sharp disparity in distribution of educational benefits (Govt. of Pakistan, 1999).

Moreover, according to Govt. of Pakistan (1999), formal system of education, as the name indicates is provided in formal institutions such as schools, colleges, universities, polytechnics, vocational and commercial institution, such institutions exist for the purpose of providing instruction to a specific clientele according to a set format. Elements as grades or classes, academic certification, syllabus/curriculum, teachers, examinations/evaluation are the constituent parts of the pattern of formal education. In short, the formal organization of the teaching-learning process is the system of formal education.

## 2.1.4 Non-Formal Education:

According to UNESCO (1986), non-formal system differs from formal system in the sense that it takes place outside the traditional framework of the formal system. However, like formal system, non-formal system is organized and has pre-determined objectives. It also has certain sequential learning structures which are not necessarily graded. While formal education is rigid and is characterized by uniformity to a large extent, the hallmark of non-formal education system is its flexibility in terms of time and duration of learning, content, methodology of instruction and evaluation procedures.

Furthermore, Govt. of Pakistan (1999) stated that non-formal is any deliberately organized educational activity, outside the established frame-work of normal schools and university systems, principally, for out of schools youth and adults, for the purpose of communicating ideas, developing skills, changing attitudes or modifying behaviour related to the realization of development goals and the achievement of higher standards of living and the welfare of the people.

According to Aggarwal (1988), non-formal system, as a national programme, cannot function in isolation. When other development agencies (that are already functioning in the process of development through their various development programmes) come closer to work simultaneously, non-formal programmes can have direct bearing on improved health and sanitation, better environmental conservation, improved social relationship, sustained preservation of culture, and the like, Adoption of an improved method of production and increase in productivity would lead to higher standard of living that is a sure sign of personal and national development.

## 2.1.5 Equity:

The concept of equity goes beyond equality of opportunity, where everyone is treated the same, to fostering a bias-free environment where individuals benefit equally. It recognizes that some people require additional and specialized support in order to achieve equal benefits. Equity in education, therefore, would take into consideration not only equal access to education of a particular standard, but the contents of curriculum, instructional and evaluation materials and practices, different ways of learning and views of knowledge, and everyone having the opportunity to achieve (Aly, 2007)

According to the Convention Against Discrimination in Education adapted by UNESCO (n.d.), any distinction, exclusion, limitation or preference which, being based on race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, economic condition or birth, as the purpose or effect of nullifying or impairing equality of treatment in education is tantamount to discrimination. This refers to all types and levels of education and includes access to education, the standard and quality of education, and the conditions under which it is given.

The Convention against Discrimination in Education has not been ratified by Pakistan. Although, constitutionally all citizens are equal before the law, in practice there is discrimination in various forms in the education system, mostly due to social customs and poor implementation of education programmes. Poor children, girl students, students from rural areas and students from minorities are particularly affected by inequalities and inequities in the education system.

We need to look at both equality and equity in public and private education, focusing on institutions and students. It is our purpose to address issues of gender, economic and geographic disparities, and parallel systems of education and medium of instruction, especially teaching of the English language (Aly, 2007).

## 2.2 Global Gender Disparities in Primary and Secondary Education:

Gender disparities in primary education stem first and foremost from enrolment patterns in the first grade. In 2005, 94 girls started Grade 1 for every 100 boys, according to the global average. Overall, gender disparities in access have improved since 1999, especially in South and West Asia (from 83 to 92 girls per 100 boys). However, there are just 80 girls (or less) for every 100 boys starting school in Afghanistan, the Central African Republic, Chad, Niger, Pakistan and Yemen. (UNESCO, 2008)

Once girls gain access to school, they tend to do better than boys. The few countries where girls repeat grades more than boys are mostly in sub-Saharan Africa and the Arab States. Overall, girls and boys reached the last grade of primary school in equal proportions in 2004. However, important differences in school survival persist, especially those favouring girls in Latin America and the Caribbean. In sub-Saharan Africa and the Arab States, roughly the same number of countries report gender gaps in favour of boys as those in favour of girls. (UNESCO, 2008)

In 2005, disparities at the secondary level favoured boys in 61 countries, slightly more than the 53 countries where girls were at an advantage. Boys' underachievement in terms of participation and performance is increasingly an issue, especially in Latin America and the Caribbean. This is the only region where there are more girls enrolled in secondary education than boys (90 boys or fewer enrolled for every 100 girls in 11 countries). (UNESCO, 2008)

According to UNESCO 2008, there were 94 girls enrolled in secondary education for every 100 boys compared to 91 in 1999. It is important to note that the pace of change actually slowed during this period, compared to 1991 and 1999. In fact, gender disparities actually increased in sub-Saharan Africa between 1999 and 2005. This region, as well as South and West Asia, report the lowest levels of girls' participation in secondary education, with 83 and 79 girls enrolled, respectively, for every 100 boys.

## 2.2.1 Global Dropout Trend:

School drop out is derived as the difference between the number of pupils/students enrolled at the beginning of the year and the number who enrolled at the end of the year' (MGLSD, 2000, 12).

In almost all developing countries, school dropout or low completion rates have been a subject of interest to academics, researchers, and policy makers for a long time. According to the Poverty Status Report (PSR, 2005), the phenomenon of high school dropout rate continues to pose a big challenge to the successful implementation of national policies. Although the findings of various studies differ depending on the peculiar country specific situations, rural- urban divide, gender bias, and distance to school appear to be the most common elements in all the studies.

The study by Holmes (2003) found out that overall; females receive less education than males, and they tend to dropout, or are withdrawn earlier for both economic and socialcultural reasons. The study furthers argues that the opportunity cost of sending female children to school in rural areas, where girls are married quite early, is high because benefits of their schooling will not accrue to their parental household. Similarly Kasente, (2003), Kakuru, (2003) explain how early marriages influence children's dropping out of school especially as regards the girl child as it is perceived by parents that marrying off the girl child is an escape route from poverty.

Odaga and Heneveld (1995), further note that parents worry about wasting money on the education of girls because there are most likely to get pregnant or married before completing their schooling and that once married, girls become part of another family and the parental investment in them is lost this therefore perpetuates parents discouraging the girl child from continuing with school.

Literature with regard to the impact of parent's education on schooling of children reflects that the children of more educated parents are more likely to be enrolled and more likely to progress further through school. Holmes, (2003) shows that this impact differs by gender, the education of the father increases the expected level of school retention of boys, and that of the mother's enhances the educational attainment of girls. Similarly other studies by Behrman et al., (1999) and Swada and Lokshin (2001) reported a consistently positive and significant coefficient of father's and mother's education at all levels of education except at secondary school level.

United Nations Children Education Fund (UNICEF, 1999) demonstrates that Parental decisions do affect children retention. Students, whose parents monitor and regulate their activities, provide emotional support, encourage independent decision making and are generally more involved in their schooling are less likely to dropout of school. Taking into account of the gender dimension of dropouts, UNICEF, (2005) notes that girls are more likely to dropout of school than boys and that pupils whose mother's have not attained any level of education will most likely dropout of school.

## 2.3 Situation in Pakistan:

Different sources indicate that that education system in Pakistan generally is not doing well. Tracing causative factors responsible for the present state is a critical need. These include defective curricula, dual medium of instruction, poor quality of teachers, cheating in the examinations and overcrowded classrooms. However, efforts are on the way of moulding the curriculum in accordance with our ideological, moral and cultural values as well as our national requirements in the fields of science, technology, medicine, engineering and agriculture, etc but it is not yet being considered and given importance to design a separate curriculum for girls as they have different educational needs and life interests. (Memon, 2007).

Literacy levels continue to be low with male literacy being higher at 61.3% and female literacy considerably below the average at 36.8%. According to the 1998 provincial population census reports, the school age population of the age group 5-9 years is more than 20 million. Of this about 11 million (57%) have never attended school. The nexus between poverty and education is reflected in the data which shows that 42% of the population living in households with illiterate heads is poor, compared to 21% of those in households with literate heads. Net primary enrolment rate is 59% for the non-poor, and 37% for the poor, and is particularly low among poor female children in rural areas (SPDC, 2002).

In addition to the public sector, the private sector is emerging as a major contender in providing access to education at all levels and in all fields including professional and technical. There are 36, 096 private schools in the country. Of the total the majority are in the Punjab 66. 4%, while Sindh accounts for 17.9%, NWFP 12.3%, Balochistan.5%, FATA 0.9% and Islamabad Capital Territory 1%. Urban areas account for 61% and rural areas 39% of private schools (FBS Survey, 2001).

Under Pakistan's Social Action Programme billions of rupees were allocated to the four social sectors with education as a priority area. Yet, there was an actual decline in the gross enrolment rate for primary education (FBS, 1998).

## 2.3.1 Gender and Education in Pakistan:

The educational status of women in Pakistan is unacceptably low, in fact, amongst the lowest in the world. The problem emanates at the primary level, as low participation and high dropouts at that stage prevent females from reaching higher education and equitable opportunities for such furtherance do not become available to the female gender. According to the Ministry of Women Development, only 19% of females have attained education unto Matriculate, 8% unto Intermediate, 5% a Bachelor's degree and 1.4% achieved a Master's degree. 60% of the female adult population is illiterate. Of the

3.3 million out of school children, 2.503 million are girls. 73.6% of primary age girls attend school, compared with 92.1% of boys. Moreover, a sizeable majority of rural girls drop out of primary schools. (Aly, 2007)

Women in Pakistan do not form a homogeneous entity; their opportunities vary greatly with the social system that they are part of. In rural areas, patriarchal structures often combined with poverty, limit opportunities to women, while women belonging to the upper and middle classes have increasingly greater access to education and employment opportunities and can assume greater control over their lives. (Aly, 2007)

Although education has been seen to add value to a female worker, increase her productivity and make her less vulnerable to violence or harassment, it is often the economic productivity and security that are given as reasons that are used to hold girls back from schooling. Poor families allocate scarce resources to their sons' education, expecting higher economic returns. Cultural limitations discourage parents from sending their daughters to mixed gender schools. However, the problem is not just of demand. There have been situations where girls are enrolled in boys' schools even unto matriculate level, indicating that supply of quality girls schooling is falling short. Similarly poor physical environment or lack of basic facilities in schools also discourages parents from sending their girls to schools. To remove these supply side blockages, unwavering support and coordination between all stakeholders (politicians, bureaucrats, government departments, planners, implementers and community organizations) is required. Right from 1947 till 1998 the emphasis on girls education finds due articulations in the policy documents but the physical targets were not matched with financial and social investment in the cause of female education and hence the appalling state in which the underprivileged women of Pakistan find themselves. (Aly, 2007)

## 2.3.2 Gender Disparities in Education, Pakistan:

Education is important especially for women and girls because it provides important means for their empowerment. Apart from the acquisition of knowledge and values conducive to social evolution, education provides many other benefits. The development of the mind, training in logical and analytical thinking, organizational, administrative and management skills accrue through education. Enhanced self-esteem and improved financial and social status within the community is a direct outcome of education. Education, therefore, be made available to all. For better parenting and healthier living also, education is an important factor. It is beyond doubt that educating girls can yield a higher rate of return than any other investment.

There is great difference in the rates of enrolment of boys, as compared to girls in Pakistan. According to UNESCO figures (Dawn, 23 Feb 2007, editorial), primary school enrolment for girls stands at 60 per cent as compared to 84 per cent for boys. The secondary school enrolment ratio is even more discouraging, 32 per cent for females and 46 per cent males. Regular school attendance for female students is estimated at 41 per cent while that for male students is 50 per cent.

According to the Population Census of 1998, the overall literacy rate in Pakistan was 45 percent. The number of literate females increased from 0.8 million in 1961 to 11.4 million in 1998 -97. The growth rate for males' literacy was 5.1 percent per annum. It may be noted that the overall literacy rate in Pakistan is lower when compared to other countries

in the region. The situation in rural areas, where the majority of population resides, is even more serious.

There are great disparities in access among the four provinces; plus there are high variations in rural-urban education indicators. A large proportion of the literate population is concentrated in the national and provincial capitals. The areas with low literacy are also backward in terms of economic development (Husain and Qasim 2005). Punjab being the most populated provinces hosts the largest number of state schools, while Balochistan hosts the smallest number (See Table 5).

	No of state schools	No of private schools	Enrolment in state schools	Enrolment in private schools
Punjab	42736	10080	4,759,510	958,497
Sindh	28,854	2,582	2,590,230	308,464
NWFP	18,712	2,243	2,391,909	233,085
Balochistan	7,866	403	452,403	41,932

Table 2.1 Provincial level primary school & enrolment data.

Source: MoE 2006b

However, the status of education across the provinces is not equal. Literacy rate is highest in Sindh at 56 percent and lowest in Balochistan at 37 percent. This interprovincial difference is most pronounced in literacy rates among females: as opposed to a female literacy rate of 44 percent in Punjab, in Balochistan the rate is only 19 percent (See Table 2.2).

Table 2.2: Literacy	rates (10	years and above	) for Pakistan	and Provinces 2004-05 (%	%)
---------------------	-----------	-----------------	----------------	--------------------------	----

Province	Total	Male	Female
Pakistan	53	65	40
Punjab	55	65	44
Sindh	56	68	41
NWFP	45	64	26
Balochistan	37	52	19

Source: MoF 2006b

Further there is great variation in performance across the rural and urban areas within each province and across males and females. The Gross Enrolment Rate (GER) is as high as 111 percent in urban areas of Punjab while it is as low as 41 percent in the rural areas of Balochistan (See Table 2.3).

Province/region	2001-02		2004-5		
Punjab	Male	Female	Male	Female	
Urban	95	93	111	108	
Rural	80	61	96	82	
Sindh					
Urban	91	78	103	94	
Rural	69	37	70	44	
NWFP					
Urban	100	86	100	84	
Rural	96	52	92	62	
Balochistan					
Urban	98	75	101	86	
Rural	73	38	79	41	

Table 2.3: Gross enrolment rate at the primary level by province and region

Source: (MoF 2006b).

The rates of transition from primary to middle also vary across provinces: during 2004-2005 the rate was 87.61 for Punjab, followed by 80.01 for Balochistan, 77.73 for NWFP and 65.98 for Sindh.

The access to education is also marked by income difference: the over all literacy rate among the poor is 28 percent, while that for the non-poor is 49 percent; the net enrolment rate is 37 percent for the poor as opposed to 59 percent for the non-poor (World Bank 2002). The enrolments remain the lowest among the poorest quintile and dropouts highest among this group. This pattern persists across rural and urban regions of all provinces (World Bank 2002). This becomes all the more worrying viewed against the fact that 65 per cent of the population lives below 2 dollars a day (UNESCO 2006).

The disparities in access on basis of gender also continue. The female enrolment rates are lower than males and drop out rates among girls are higher (World Bank 2002).

Province	Gender gap in literacy %		Gender ga the primar	p in NER at y level	Gender ga primary lev	p in GER at the /el
	2001-02	2004-05	2001-02	2004-05	2001-02	2001-04
Pakistan	26	25	8	8	22	17
Punjab	21	21	4	5	15	11
Sindh	29	27	12	11	25	19
NWFP	37	38	15	13	41	28
Balochistan	38	33	15	15	33	34

Table 2.4: Gender gap in overall literacy, GER and NER at the primary level (%) 2004-05

Source: MoF 2006b.

Against these challenges the government has failed to increase education facilities at the national level to meet the needs of all. It has also failed to develop strategies to bridge the disparities on basis of income, region, and urban/rural divide. The annual increase in the number of public primary schools is below the need: during 2005-6, only 1221 primary state schools were established (MoF 2006b). Emphasis is also being placed on opening state financed non-formal schools through NGOs. The Ministry of Education claims to have already established 10,374 Non Formal Basic Education (NFBE) schools across the country and aims to take the number up to 82,000 (GoP &

UNESCO 2005). There are no independent assessments of the performance of children in these schools but according to government's claims they have a 75 percent pass rate in the government administrated fifth grade examinations (GoP & UNESCO 2005). A National and Four Provincial Education Foundations, which are government established NGOs, have also been set-up to promote community schools. Even if these schools are providing acceptable education, they confront the problem of mainstreaming. There are not enough state middle schools to absorb children completing primary in these schools. The NGOs are also unable to upgrade their own schools to middle or secondary due to lack of availability of qualified teachers in remote areas to teach at middle and secondary-levels. This low emphasis on middle and secondary educational institutions affects retention at primary level. There is a dramatically decrease in number of state schools from primary to middle and from middle to secondary (See Table 2.5).

Level	Institutions	Enrolment	Teachers	
Primary	157,158	21,333,206	450,136	
Middle	30,418	4,550,473	246,666	
Secondary	16,590	1,880,021	282,113	

Table 2.5: No. state schools at primary, middle and secondary level

Source: MoF 2006b.

#### 2.3.3 Curriculum development:

Pakistan has a centralized system of curriculum development. Under the *Federal Supervision of Curricula, Textbooks and Maintenance of Standards Education Act-1976*, the process of curriculum development and approval of textbooks was centralized. In December 1976, the federal government nominated the Curriculum Wing of the Ministry of Education as the 'competent authority' for classes' 1-XII and the University Grants Commission for beyond Class XII. Provincial Textbook Boards were established in each of the four provinces, which were given the responsibility for developing the textbooks. Prior to 1962, textbooks were prepared by a number of publishers in the country and the schools were empowered to adopt any of the multiple options.

While a curriculum normally focuses on four areas: aims and objectives, content, methodology and evaluation, the White Paper maintains that in Pakistan there is normally not much difference made between curriculum and text books (Aly, 2007). The curriculum as reflected in the textbooks in Pakistan has suffered from multiple problems including irrelevance to the local context, obsolete content (Aly, 2007), and strong ideological indoctrination. Even within non-formal programmes, the curriculum is not responsive to local community needs. Also, HIV/AIDS related issues remain a taboo subject and History and Social Studies textbooks at 9 and 10 grades suffer from major omission post 1973 to avoid documentation of controversial facts. Another problem in curriculum is that the textbooks have not been made comparatively more gender sensitive.

The National Education Policy 1998-2010 envisions a single curriculum for the entire country: currently, the schools offering O and A levels follow a different curriculum from the others. Currently, the national curriculum review process is at the final stages. A team of experts has been working on it since early 2006. A detailed curriculum has been developed and the provinces are now in the process of developing their respective textbooks to fit that curriculum. These books once developed will have to be approved by the federal authorities. It is expected that the new textbooks will enter the market

starting from fall 2009. However, the capacity of the textbook boards to produce good books remains extremely weak so it is yet to be seen if the new books produced will remove the existing inaccuracies and ideological biases in the text. The government is keen to encourage local private publishers to enter this market but as yet has failed to put in place measures to build their capacity.

## 2.3.4 Relevance of Education:

Policy makers in Pakistan have been preoccupied in seeking ways of making the content of education more meaningful and the methods of delivery more cost-effective within the context of nation building and economic development. The attention has been on the role of education in preparing children to participate actively and productively in national building. The literature is full of such attempts at making education more relevant. The lack of social demand for education is related to the fact that families and communities do not value or are ambivalent about formal education. Serpell (1993) pointed to the parental disillusionment with the present education systems and expressed support for more relevant curricula; more closely related to the daily lives of students and providing practical skills for students. Odaga and Heneveld (1995) contended that the problem is even more acute with girls where gender bias in subject choices together with cultural factors limits girls' chances of progress.

## 2.3.5 Role of GO and NGOs in promoting education:

Traditionally the government has been the primary provider of education at the primary and secondary level and continues to be so till now. However, the role of the private sector in education provision is increasing at all levels.

The NGOs have become active players since 1980s especially in non-formal education: a DFID funded study of education NGOs in Punjab shows that out of the 233 education organizations surveyed in Punjab, the majority (84 per cent) were established in 1980s and within southern Punjab, around 60 per cent were established in the 1990s (Zafar & Rashid 2003). They also constitute a significant number: another survey of NGOs in Pakistan shows that after religious education, primary education is the top priority activity of the registered voluntary organizations in Pakistan with 8.5 per cent working in this field (Ghaus-Pasha et. al 2002). Another sign of their growing influence is that under donor funded projects, the government is increasingly contracting teacher training of government teachers to NGOs and allowing them to adopt government schools (Sarwar 2006).

The NGO run non-formal schools have also been considered as an important mechanism to increase access for children in remote areas especially girls. The NGOs are also taking a lead in introducing child cantered teaching methods. They are also starting to mainstream their children into government schools: the children in non-formal schools are normally required to take government fifth grade exam. With an emphasis on improving education indicators, the government has further facilitated the mainstreaming process by allowing reiterative mainstreaming to many education NGOs. However, the insufficient number of middle and secondary state schools continues to pose challenge to the mainstreaming process to basic education in Pakistan.

#### Non-formal programmes for working children

In addition, many NGOs and the National and Provincial Education Foundations are implementing non-formal education programmes for working children. These programmes aim to provide flexible teaching hours. However, most of them are small in number in terms of total outreach and are relatively recent. A recent study by Sindh Education Foundation (SEF) profiled some prominent NGO led innovative models. The following section, drawn upon a few case profiles developed in the SEF study (Sarwar 2006).

Godh, an NGO, which has been running *Community Schools for Gypsy Children* since 2000 works on the notion of mobile schools which move with the community and focus on gypsy children in the age group of 4-18 years. The system utilizes internally developed material that caters to the requirements of older illiterate children but reverts to state curriculum in class 5 to facilitate mainstreaming. The schools generally operate on the principle of multi-grade teaching with one classroom and one teacher.

SAHE, another NGO, has been running a *Community Based School Program (CBSP) for Girls* since 1998. At present the program comprises 220 schools and teachers with an enrolment of 6340 girls in the 3 districts of Pakpattan, Lodhran (2003) and Vehari (2004). The program is spread over 6 years where 5.5 years are for regular schooling and 6 months for a pre-primary class, as it has proved effective in improving retention. SAHE uses a combination of government textbooks and those developed by the Oxford University Press. It addition, it tries to localize geography textbooks to the district concerned (Sarwar 2006).

Zindagi Trust addresses issues of functional literacy with a focus on English, Urdu and Math: these subjects are considered to be directly relevant to the working child's needs in routine communication and calculation. Its "Paid to learn" program maintains that any attempt to induct working children into schools needs to compensate for the income they will be expected to forgo during class time. The field officer of the Trust interacts with the employer of the child to negotiate a financial pact whereby the employer reduces the pay for the hours spent in the school and the Trust compensates the child to cover up for the loss in earning. The schools run for 3 hours, from 2-5pm, to adjust to peak working hours (Sarwar 2006).

ANCE (Association of Network for Community Empowerment), another NGO, was formed in 1996 to provide basic education to working children. ANCE has 4 centres in Lahore, working for children involved in domestic and external labour who work in trades ranging from shoemaking, automobile, glass making to brick kilns. The centres are located in areas where such trades are concentrated. These centres run as non-formal schools. After class 5 the children are encouraged to mainstream however it is largely a matter of the parent's will. The programme also caters to disabled children (Sarwar 2007).

The Idara-e-eTaleem-o-Agahi (ITA), an NGO registered in 2001, on the other hand has tried to improve student retention within government schools by taking over several public schools under the Adopt a School Programme, where the government allows the private sector or NGOs to help strengthen the capacity of government schools. The strength of the ITA model is that it is working directly with the government to improve government education delivery system. It is formally engaged with the public sector in the strict capacity of a 'technical partner,' (Sarwar 2006).

There are many other examples of NGOs involved in such innovative projects to improve access. However, the problem is that they have very small outreach and more importantly none of these programmes have been systematically evaluated for its impact on access and quality. They are noticeable because they demonstrate some obvious strengths and innovations, which are verifiable on visits to the organization. It is, however, difficult to recommend their replication without first undertaking systematic cost-benefit analysis of these programmes, impact on desired outcomes of increased access and quality, and their feasibility for large-scale replications. In general even the bigger NGOs involved in these programmes show weak capacity to sustain these projects for long and are heavily reliant on development aid for survival. Also, their scale remains very small in comparison with the magnitude of the problem (Sarwar, 2006).

Thus despite some positive developments, much needs to be done to ensure access to all. There needs to be a more focused effort in understanding the supply and demand factors affecting access to basic education. The Pakistan Education Census so far does not provide data about who the out of school children are or who are the youth and adults who do not have access to education opportunities. But, an NGO project aimed at mainstreaming high risk drop out children in government schools working in two districts (Kasur and Sheikhupura) of Punjab shows that punishment of children regardless of the reason is a strong factor in putting them at the risk of dropping out (ITA 2006). The government thus needs to better understand and address the many hurdles to access. The current increase in access is primary attributed to the expansion of the private sector and state sponsored non-formal programmes implemented through NGOs or NGOs own independent programmes rather than the required expansion in the network of formal state schools. This emphasis on private schooling is indirectly overshadowing the need for improving state schools. This is a worrying trend as it is creating a bigger divide between the rich and the poor as the low-fee charging private schools that the poor can afford have no competition with the higher-fee charging private schools where the rich send their children. Also, the emphasis on increasing number of state sponsored non-formal schools without increasing the number of middle and secondary state schools to mainstream these children presents a major challenge to increasing access.

# CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY

## 3.1 Area of Study

#### 3.1.1 Sindh Province as an Overview:

Sindh is one of the four provinces of Pakistan and historically is home to the Sindhis. Different cultural and ethnic groups also reside in Sindh including Urdu - speaking Muslim refugees who migrated to Pakistan from India upon independence as well as the people migrated from other provinces after independence. The Neighbouring regions of Sindh are Balochistan to the west and north, Punjab to the north, the border with India to the east, and the Arabian Sea to the south. The main languages are Sindhi and Siraiki. In Sanskrit, the province was dubbed Sindhu meaning "Ocean". The Assyrians (as early as the seventh century BCE) knew the region as Sinda, the Persians as Abisind, the Greeks as Sinthus, the Romans as Sindus, the Chinese as Sintow, while the Arabs dubbed it Sindh.

*Geography:* Sindh is located on the western corner of South Asia , bordering the Iranian Plateau in the west. Geographically it is the third largest province of Pakistan, stretching about 579 km from north to south and 442 km (extreme) or 281 km (average) from east to west, with an area of 54,407 square miles or 140,915 km<sup>2</sup> of Pakistani territory. Sindh is bounded by the Thar Desert to the east, the Kirthar Mountains to the west, and the Arabian Sea in the south. In the centre is a fertile plain around the Indus river. The devastating floods of the river Indus are now controlled by irrigation techniques.

Karachi became capital of Sindh in 1936, in place of the traditional capitals of Hyderabad and Thatta. Other important cities include Sanghar, Sukkur, Dadu, Shahdadkot, Sehwan, Mirpukhas, Larkana, Shikarpur, Nawabshah, Kashmore, Umerkot, Tharparkar, Jacobabad, Ghotki, Ranipur, and Moro.

*Demographics and Society:* The 1998 Census of Pakistan indicated a population 30.4 million, the current population can be estimated to be in the range of 42 to 44 million using a compound growth in the range of 2% to 2.8% since then. With just under half being urban dwellers, mainly found in Karachi, Hyderabad, Sukkur, Mirpurkhas, Nawabshah, Umerkot and Larkana. Sindhi is the sole official language of Sindh since the 19th century. Going just by language, Sindhi speakers make up 70% and Urdu speakers make up 20%, while 9% of the total population of Sindh speaks Seraiki, Kutchi (both dialects of Sindhi), Khowar, Pashto, Punjabi, Balochi, Thari, Persian/Dari, Brahui and Gujrati. Both Balochis of Sindh and Sindhis speak Sindhi language as their mother tongue.

Sindh's population is predominantly Muslim, but Sindh is also home to nearly all (93%) of Pakistan's Hindus, numbering roughly 3.5 million. Most Sindhi Hindus migrated to India at the time of the independence. Smaller groups of Christians, Parsis or Zoroastrians and a tiny Jewish community (of around 500) can also be found in the province.

The Sindhis as a whole are composed of original descendants of an ancient population known as Sammaat, various sub-groups related to the Seraiki or Baloch origin are found in interior Sindh. Sindhis of Balochi origin make up about 30% of the total population of Sindh, while Urdu-speaking Muhajirs make up 20% of the total population of the

province. Also found in the province is a small group claiming descent from early Muslim settlers including Arabs, Turks, Pashtuns and Persian.

*Economic Activities:* Sindh is a major centre of economic activity in Pakistan and has a highly diversified economy ranging from heavy industry and finance centred in and around Karachi to a substantial agricultural base along the Indus. Pakistan's rapidly growing information technology sector (IT) is also centred in Karachi and manufacturing includes machine products, cement, plastics, and various other goods.

Agriculture is very important in Sindh with cotton, rice, wheat, sugar cane, bananas, and mangoes as the most important crops. Sindh is the richest province in natural resources of gas, petrol, and coal.

## 3.1.2 District Matiari

Matiari District is located in Sindh, Pakistan, the city of Matiari is the capital. The district is administratively subdivided into three talukhas (Divisions) namely Hala, Matiari and Saeedabad. The area selected for the study is village Bakhar Jamali which comes under the administration of Matiari Division. This area is known for its good quality ajraks (cloth). Matiari is known for the a lot of special things including the religion, culture, civilization, architecture, people and food. in food category piyalo,daal firai,icecream,maava.

#### 3.2 Data Collection:

The researcher used both qualitative as well as quantitative methodologies for data collection.

The qualitative method used in this study was focus group discussion which is a in-depth approach of data collection, which was necessary in this research so as to get more intrinsic information for in-depth analytical description on the responses, attitudes, values, feelings and aspirations of respondents. It was also used to get more understanding of gender differences, feelings and reactions among the respondents.

The Survey was used as quantitative method, to identify the factors which were hindering the girls to get education describe the degree to which these factors have influence to get and keep the girls in school. Survey also aimed at finding out the tangible evidence of the problems prevailing in the area in the process of education of girls.

These methods were used in village Bakhar Jamali a rural area in District Matiari of Province Sindh of Pakistan, the research site, where FMEWS is focusing. The target groups for this study were male parents, female parents, young girls, teachers from school, GO and NGOs officials as the respondents.

#### 3.2.1 Survey:

#### Sampling:

A survey was conducted as mentioned earlier in the chapter. The selected area constitutes of 525 households comprising about 3675 inhabitants who are basically extremely poor and poorly educated. Systematic sampling approach was adopted to select 50 respondents who had female children from 5 to 18 years of age. According to systematic technique total number of households in the village was divided with the sample size which was decided as 50 and then multiplied by (525 / 50 = 10). The first household was selected as 6<sup>th</sup> house by using systematic random sampling and the subsequent numbers obtained by adding 10 in each that is 6<sup>th</sup> Household and further by adding 10 in the ensuring number (6<sup>th</sup>, 16<sup>th</sup>, 26<sup>th</sup> .....). In some cases the selected household according to the formula did not have the female child or those girls who are still continuing schooling according to the prescribed age then the 1<sup>st</sup> neighboring house was interviewed. The household which have more than one girl child with the prescribed age, it was counted as 1 household = 1 girl, as to interview other households as well. It is because many of households have more than one girl which could limit us to interview only few households. By doing so we found that 45 were male headed household and 5 female headed households.

#### 3.2.2 Survey Methodology:

A questionnaire was designed and the questionnaire was pre-tested on 5 persons before launching the survey. A team of 4 persons was selected from within the FMEWS under the supervision of the researcher to collect the data. The team was given training on interviewing technique of qualitative data and objective of the study for two days. Each person was deputed to collect information in 5 days. Each interviewer completed 2 questionnaires per day. The researcher remained with each person for a half day on 5 full working days. However, 5 respondents from additional households using the same technique were interviewed to reveal the accuracy and validity of data already collected.

## 3.2.3 Focus Group Discussion:

After conducting survey, focus group discussions were arranged with three distinct groups, comprising of seven male, seven females, and seven key informants from government organizations and NGOs officials in the target area. They were explained the objective of the study and were presented the results of the survey.

Male parent group consists of people aging between 30-50 years old were those who did not participated in the survey and were inhabitants of village Bakhar Jamali. This group was named as group 1.

Group 2 consists of female parents and young girls aging between 18-40 years to get the views of women and girls. While conducting a focus group discussion with this group it was required to hire a female to ask them questions because of cultural restrictions. It was not allowed for a man to interview them. Interviewing them in a group gave them confidence to express freely which was not possible in individual interview.

The third group which was given name of group 3 included teachers from government and private schools, local union council member from district government Matiari, district education officer from department of education, Sindh and finally a programme officer from a local NGO named AL-Khidmat Foundation working also on promotion of education for girls in the Sindh province of Pakistan. They were called in the Executive District Officer Office, Matiari for focus group discussion.

	No of	Age	Profession
	Participants	-	
Group 1 (Male Parents of girls aged 5-18 years)	7	30 - 50	Farmers (2), Labor (Daily Wages) (4), Unemployed (1)
Group 2 Female Parents of girls (aged 5-18 years) and Young	7	18 – 40	House wives
Girls (aged 18-25) Group 3 (Teachers, GO and NGOs officials)	7	25 – 50	Teachers (4) District Education Officer, Matiari. (1) UC Member Bakhar Jamali. (1) Programme Officer. (Al Khidmat Foundation). (1)
TOTAL	21		

Table 3.1. Distribution of respondents for Focus Groups Discussion

Each of the group consists of seven people and total sample was twenty one respondents. Luckily they all participated in the group discussion. In that area local language was spoken and therefore for conducting group discussions with group 1 a translator was hired but in group 2 the female was playing the role of translator.

#### 3.3 Literature Reviews

Intensive literature review was done before going into the field. In formal documents such as unpublished project reports, annual reports of department of education, education policy were used to gather more information on education of girls so as to compliment the data collected. Literature on other country experiences regarding girl's education were used to augment the data collected from the internet. Desk literature review was done to give more insight into the topic.

## 3.4 Data Synthesis

Descriptive statistical analysis and interpretation was used to synthesis quantitative data collected from the questionnaires' closed questions. In-depth interpretation using comparisons from literature was mainly used for the qualitative data collected form interviews and open-ended questions.

## 3.5 Limitations

The area of investigation was quite challenging in quite number of aspects. It seemed a wide subject that cannot be easily confined. It was very overwhelming especially when it came to analyzing the data as there were no clear cut lines of thoughts or ideas. Limitation in time was therefore a serious constraint. In most cases I had to fit into the

schedules for the respondents and this often meant long period of waiting. This is one area of investigation that I would recommend that time be allocated generously.

Lack of financial resources; a lot of follow up was done for some of the respondents who were out in the field for them to submit questionnaire as they are used to being appreciated for their participation in monetary terms. To get cooperation from some of the participants, it required that I give them some token as this is the culture of most research organizations.

Literature specific to was limited; it appears that not much has been done in the area of education for girls. There was a lot of groping in the dark and it is hoped that this study will be one step forward in this particular area. The gender disaggregated data was hardly available and was too old.

With the above limitations, discussions and conclusions have been made bearing them in mind and additional research in this area may be needed in future.

#### 3.6 Background of Fatima Memorial Educational and Welfare Society (FMWES)

Fatima Memorial Educational and Welfare Society (FMEWS) is a volunteer organization established in 2000 and registered under "The Societies Registration Act XXI of 1860" Government of Pakistan. It is mainly working in Sindh province, southern part of Pakistan and gradually expending in other parts of Pakistan. It is a non profit organization focusing on capacity building of community on various social development issues such as human rights, women and children rights, advocacy and lobbying, health, with primary focus formal and non formal education and literacy. The organization is promoting primary and secondary education, and has established ten schools in the various rural divisions of Sindh. It is also providing vocational education for adult women including capacity building trainings on awareness about gender, and also income generating activities for women like embroidery, handicraft and carpet making etc.

FMEWS is currently involved in many projects which are addressing the women issues in the area. It is also running a school in the area which is for both boys and girls. However girls being most disadvantaged group are given special attention by given special attention in terms of fee waivers, free books, school uniforms, IT trainings, and special tuitions.

Recently the organization has completed the project of community mobilization and gender awareness in district Nawabshah. The project was funded by Ministry of Women Development, Government of Pakistan. The organization has also completed the project of gender sensitization training workshops held at Sukkur, funded by Ministry of Women Development Government of Pakistan.

The organization within past five years has achieved quite good results in terms of promoting education, capacity building through seminars and workshops etc. for disadvantaged groups therefore it has also started participating in other avenues of development like environmental protection, poverty alleviation and women health. Eventually the organization has diverse its activities in broader context after initiated with focus on education like sanitation, environmental protection, gender rights, advocacy, political education/ awareness, primary health care, capacity building at grass-root and also spreading its activities other areas of the province Sindh.

# **CHAPTER 4: RESULTS**

#### 4.1 Demographic Characteristics:

Table 4.1 shows age distribution of girls in those households who were interviewed through questionnaire. It was found that out of 50 households 45 were male headed household and 5 were female headed household. The population statistics and demographic characteristics of these households are as under:

Table 4.1: Age Distribution of girls (5-18 Years)

Age	Number	Percent
5 – 9	19	38
10 – 14	15	30
15 – 18	16	32
Total:	50	100%

Size of population: 3,675 No. of Total Children 1250 Female children aged from 5 – 18 years: 637

The means of livelihood (table 4.2) reveal that they were awfully poor. Majority of them were (60%) Agricultural labors followed by daily wage earners while 10% had no jobs.

Means	Frequency	Percent
Agricultural Labor	25	60
Daily wages	10	20
Their Children Work	7	14
Shop labor	3	6
Un Employed	5	10
Total	50	100

#### Table 4.2 Means of Livelihood of Households

The table 4.3 divulges that substantial majority of students (56%) did not attend and those who ever attended schools but dropped out are 44%. A part from these only 4 households was such in which girls were continuing their schooling.

Table 4.3 Female children never attended, I	Dropped out and stil	l continuing education.

Status	Frequency	Percent
Never Attended	28	56
Dropped Out	22	44
Total	50	100

Table 4.4 demonstrates the relationship of income level of households and level of education in girls ageing from 5 - 18 years old living in those household.

Income Level	Nil	Primary	Secondary	Matriculate 10 <sup>th</sup> Standard	Total
Low < 3000	19	1	0	0	20
Medium 3000 – 4999	6	5	2	0	13
High 5000 - 10000	3	8	5	1	17
Total	28	14	7	1	50

Table 4.4 Distribution of Income level and education level of girls in households:

#### 4.1 Socio economic facts influencing the girls to get education:

Table 4.5 reflects the responses from questionnaires administered to households with different income levels, regarding reasons behind low enrollment and dropout of girl's in school. 24% households answered that girls are engaged in household activities. This was followed by another majority (20%) of respondents saying that school was too far. (4%) answered that their girl got married therefore she quitted schooling.

Table 4.5 Reasons for Girls Low enrollment and Dropouts in relationship with Household Income level.

Reasons	Income Level			Total	
	Low	Medium	High	Frequency	Percent
Need of Girls in Household			-		
activities	5	2	5	12	24
Need girls in farm activities	6	4	0	10	20
Education not necessary for girls	4	3	2	9	18
Discouraging school environment	0	1	6	7	14
School too far	2	3	2	7	14
Security problems	1	0	2	3	6
Got married	2	0	0	2	4
	20	13	17	50	100

The main constraints emerged as a result of this survey were categorized as under:

- a) Need girls in household and farm level activities
- b) School too far and security problem
- c) Education not necessary for girls
- d) No Immediate gain from education
- e) Discouraging school Environment.

While discussing the issues, some of the common or differing trends were observed, responses are provided in italics.

#### a) Need Girls in Household and Farms activities:

The first reason mentioned by them was need of girls in household activities. It was clearly expressed by the most of the respondents in the group of male (group 1) and female (group 2) parents that the girls are not bread earners and suppose to stay at home. Their role is to help her mother at home in cooking, cleaning, washing, fetching

water, collecting fuel wood and taking care of children. During her schedule she gets very little time free and which does not match with the school timing.

While discussing in the focus group discussion that what do they think about the problem that girls have to work at home also in the field and are not sent to school for education? Some of the common views were:

"Girls have to look after their small brothers and help mother in kitchen. While we are out to work in farm, they are responsible to do all the household work. They don't have time to attend school."

"Farm Labor is very costly and I cannot afford. Our girls and women have to work in the field and graze animals. Specially harvesting time women and girls do the picking of the crop. Our livelihood depends on agriculture. If the girls are not going to work in farms how we are going to survive. If we send our girls to school who is going to work on behave of them. We don't have any other alternative."

When it was asked by the female group, it was found that more or less they also have the same opinion as group 1 opined. According to them girls had to work at home to help them in daily household activities like cooking, cleaning, washing, fetching water, taking care of their brothers and taking care of livestock. It was also observed that girls do have to work at the farm also at the time of harvesting for crop picking etc to earn additional income for livelihood. It was felt that school timing is not suitable for them and they have to work at that time. They suggested that the school timing should be made flexible for girls.

"I need help from my daughter, she need to clean dishes, wash cloths at home and fetch water for drinking. If she will go to school who will look after her small brother while I m going to the farm for work."

"While in the peak period of time my daughter helps me a lot at home. School timing also does not suit us to send her to the school because half of the day time she will spend in school then who will work at home?"

"My daughter and I work in the field to earn for surviving. She is also responsible to take the animals for grazing and take care of them. How she will manage to take out time to go to school. If she will not work then we will not be able to survive."

Similarly it was queried from the group 3 about this issue. The expressions were almost the same as from both groups. They emphasized on the gender role of the girls in the rural areas and agreed with the fact. They suggested that alternative forms of education should be introduced for such girls under domestic and farm work load like mobile school or home based school for them. The following are some responses from group 3:

"In rural areas of Sindh, gender roles are categorized distinctly, where girls are responsible for household work and boys are sent to school for education. Girls have so much domestic work load that they don't get so much time to attend the school for so long."

"In some of the households girls need to work at farms to earn some income for their livelihood. In this case how come girls will be able to get time to attend the school?"

"Girls work in the cotton season when the crop is ready they do picking of crop and get emoluments from landlord if government and NGOs offer them some amount, they will readily accept the offer and would prefer to go to school instead of going in the field in hot or cold weather."

"The timings of schools are never in favor of such girls. It is suggested that school conduct special classes for this type of girls which are under the burden of domestic work load or introducing alternative forms of education like mobile schools etc."

"I do feel that you first identify the literate girls in this village and assign one literate women for teaching, acquaint them with the principle of each one to teach one. If each literate girl teaches one, we can get all the women educated in first few months."

#### b) School too far and Security problems:

The second constraint came out of the survey was school being too far and security problem in sending the girls to school. It was clearly expressed by the majority of the respondents in the focus group discussion school is too far and they cannot allow their young girls to travel so far to attend school which is insecure for them as young girls kidnap is very common in the area. This can also be a justification of introducing alternative forms of education in the area.

It was asked from the group that another major constraint faced in girls education is that the school is too far and insecurity does not allow parents to send their young girls for education. What do you think about it? The responses came out were:

"Our houses are located far from the school and it is really insecure to send our small girls to school. In the way of school there are vulgar boys who use to misbehave with our girls and sexually harass them."

"There are only three schools in the area where we can send our children. One is government school other two are private schools. The nearest one is government school which is at least 5 KM far from our home. Our boys are going to school regularly but we cannot allow our girls to way so far because we are afraid that somebody will kidnap our girl."

"School is too far from our home and also the girls have to walk a lot because the road is far from our home to get any transport."

Some of the views from group 2 which were common and grouped were:

"I took out my girl from the school because she is now grown up and it is not safe for her to travel so far to go and study."

"There is a lot of crime like kidnapping of girls and rape in the rural areas. People are afraid and send their young girls to school."

"In Muslim religion it is important that girls and women should cover their body and face with Naqab and don't come in front of Na-Mehram. In rural areas people don't compromise and strictly follow this rule, therefore don't allow their girls to go out once they are grownup."

"A solution to solve this problem of school being far in the area can be making a school in the middle of the village so that girls freely can come to school."

"Another alternate came in my mind is to let the inhabitants select one house of a old lady on which all trust and don't hesitate to send their girls there. A female teacher should be sent there to teach the girls daily."

#### c) Education not necessary for girls:

Another constraint which came out as a result of survey was education is not necessary for girls. It reflects the perception of the parents that education for girls not important and it is useless for them. While discussing this problem following were some opinions of the male parents:

"Girls are not bread earners. After all they have stay at home and work in household chores. Later when they will grow up they will get married and take care of their children."

"Girls only need to learn household works like cooking, washing, cleaning, and taking care of children. This is there duty only. Education is worthless for them."

"He is an earning person when he will grow up he has to look after his family while girls will not."

When it was asked by the female group it was found that the opinions are more or less same. Here are some of the views which were expressed by the female parents:

"I have also studied till class five. This education is not of use anywhere. From childhood if girls would learn household chores that will be good and give them benefit in the future when they will get married."

"In our village, male works outside while females need to work at home. In the harvesting season female's job is to do the picking only, otherwise they work at home."

"If girls don't know properly to cook, wash and other household works, they will suffer in future time and nobody will marry them. More than getting education and going to school, for a girl it is important to stay at home and take part in household activities."

This issue was also raised in the group 3 and they blamed the culture, traditions and lack of education among parents due to which they perceive it like that. This group also emphasized on the education of parents more than education of children. It was felt important that awareness should be raised among such parents by conducting workshops, seminars and trainings. Here are some of the views of group 3.

"Perception towards girl's education in this village and also other rural areas is same. They think that girls are not bread earners and they need to get married only and take the responsibilities towards their husbands and children. Why to educate them and invest money on them. It is really difficult to change their perception towards importance of girl education. I think parents needs to be educated more than children for changing their thinking."

"Girls have reproductive role and men have productive role in our society. It is coming like this from generations. GO's and NGO's are busy in working towards to raise awareness among women of rural areas about the importance of education by trainings, workshops and seminars. After all the actions taken by them still the results not achieved. The key reason behind this is because of men are dominating and have the decision making power."

"It is suggested that to, it is important to raise awareness among men about the importance of girl's education. Conduct motivational trainings, workshops and seminars for men and women together. Otherwise all the efforts done for looking for alternative or interventions will not help."

"I would suggest that the parents must be motivated and convinced that education of a girl is not only important but imperative for the welfare of family. In fact that educating a boy is educating a person but educating a girl means educating the entire generation rather the whole community otherwise you may do anything to improve the situation but it will not help."

#### d) No Immediate gain from Education:

Parents see education of girls as waste of time. It was expressed that investing in girl's education is worthless as there are no job opportunities available for girls who will pass the school. If they will educate their daughters ultimately they are going to get married and again will be busy in reproductive activities. It was felt that government should provide opportunities for girls who are finishing their education so that they can be attracted towards education.

*"I have done matriculation and I m jobless. Education didn't give me any benefit as I am a man, how come it will benefit my girl children."* 

"Girls need to get married, what will happen if they will go to school for some years. What will be their career in getting primary or secondary education?"

"We can't keep our daughters long time without marriage. The education she will get before marriage that will not give any benefit to us and after marriage she will not be able to continue her education. So what is the purpose of wasting time and money on education of girls?"

*"It is better to educate our boys than girls as they can get some job or earn something and take care of their parents when they are old."* 

"The government should provide job opportunities for girls and women after they complete their education so that they can be benefited."

#### e) Discouraging school environment:

Another constraint in education for girls is the discouraging school environment, gender insensitive curriculum, inadequate sanitation facilities in the school, male teachers, sexual harassment from boys in the school, overcrowded classrooms etc. It was suggested that the schools should consider the needs of girls in all aspects like curriculum should be made separately for girls considering their interests of study. Sanitation and health facilities should be provided in the schools. Separate class rooms or schools should be made for girls and female teachers should be appointed for girls so that they can feel free to go to school.

"There are no separate schools available for girls in this area. The only school which is nearest is for both boys and girls. Where classes are overcrowded, boys and girls are made to sit together. The toilets are also very dirty and same for both boys and girls in the school. In our culture it is not allowed that a girl and a boy should sit together."

"In government schools the salary for a teacher is very low and he has to look other sources of income for living like giving private tuitions etc. Due to which they are also not able to give time to the students in schools. A part from that teachers are required training for teaching as they are also learners and every child learns differently".

"Curriculum for both boys and girls is same. It should be gender sensitive as boys and girls and have different needs and interest in their life. Very few girls are interested in technical education which might require to adjust job oriented curriculum which suits boys and to include food and nutrition courses for girls"

"Sexual harassment from boys is also an issue due to which parents don't send their girls to school."

## 4.2 Diverse Educational needs and Interest of Girls in Village Bakhar Jamali:

While further investigating about the problems it was then enquired from the group 3 that what are the existing forms of schools available for the girls in village Bakhar Jamali and how do they address the diverse educational needs and interest of girls? District Education Officer informed us that:

"There are only 3 formal schools available for primary and secondary education. One is government school and two are private schools. One vocational training school is located in the area for women where women are given skill development training in different fields. Primary education in government schools is free for all but for secondary education there is fees but it is very cheap and everybody can afford. Unfortunately government is still in the process of designing separate policy and curriculum for boys and girls which will be introduced soon."

A series of arguments came out in result of this statement by the teachers from different schools and a common statement was:

"Government schools are many in the country but the quality of education in government school is very poor. Mostly the teachers are not there to teach. Sanitation facilities in the school are worst. This is the only option available for the poor where they can send their children because of being cheap. Private schools are maintaining the quality of education but they can be afforded only by rich."

"The quality of education in government schools is very poor. Most of the time teachers are not present there to teach. The behavior of teachers in government school is not good with their students. Education for boys and girls is same. Schools only emphasize on the quantity of students. There is a need to understand the diverse interests of girls from boys so that they can be attracted by the education system and it will have a positive effect on their performance. I haven't seen a single school which addresses this concept in rural areas although there are some which poor cannot afford and are in the city."

"In government schools the salary for a teacher is very low and he has to look other sources of income for living like giving private tuitions etc. Due to which they are also not able to give time to the students in schools. A part from that teachers are required training for teaching as they are also learners and every child learns differently".

## 4.3 Factors hindering in Informal system of education:

After discussing the main factors which were hindering the girls to go to school, it was then asked from the group 3 that is there any possibility we can go beyond formal schooling and look for alternative forms of education that can help educate girls? It was observed from the views of the group 3 that informal schooling can be really help to educate girls. There are many types of informal education, here only three were discussed that were distance learning, home based schools, mobile schools. It was found that distance learning cannot be introduced in rural areas because of non availability of resources like electricity and television. While mobile schools and home based schools can be introduced but it requires adequate funding to make it sustainable and that is always a problem to get. Below are some views of group 3:

"In rural areas, basic necessities like electricity, water and gas is not available. Infrastructure does not allow informal forms of education like distance learning which is provided by Allama Iqbal Open University."

"In this village, mobile and home based schools for girls can be introduced but it is not sure how long we can continue this kind of informal education programme as it requires a lot of money to make it sustainable and I think we have to try as much as we can to keep and bring girls to formal schools rather than depending on informal system of education."

#### 4.4 Role of GO and NGOs in education:

Finally it was enquired about the role of NGOs in promoting informal education for girls who cannot attend the school because of above mentioned reasons. It was informed by the group 3 that

"Most NGOs educational programs have been limited to opening free schools for poor children specially girls. Recently they have become interested in non-formal education with activities in literacy skills training being limited mostly to urban and semi-urban areas." The other arguments came from the group in response with the above statement were grouped and the agreed by all was:

"Yes but I know an exception that is the Punjab Social Services Board (PSSB), which is an outstanding, rurally based agency that delivers two programs out of literacy centers in villages. One programme is the six-month Non-Formal Basic Literacy Programme for children eight to eighteen years old; the other is two years Non-Formal Primary Education Programme for children ages eight to sixteen, which focuses on female dropouts. However the programmes delivered by PSSB are in great demand, and evaluations shown them to be very successful in terms of the number of students enrolled and their performances on examinations. It is recommended that such kind of programmes should be introduced in other areas of the country so that girls can be benefited."

# **CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSIONS**

Gender inequality is higher in education in developing countries. In Pakistan, data on education shows that the gender inequality is prevailing in both urban and rural area, although it is higher in rural areas especially in Sindh Province. The study cited that female children between 5 -18 years constitutes a sizeable proportion that is 51% among total number of children in the village Bakhar Jamali. It reflects that they are equal in number with boys but still they are disadvantaged group. It was also found that out of total number of household interviewed 56% were never sent to school and 44% who were sent to school for education has been discontinued in the middle.

The study divulges that main source of livelihood in the village was agricultural labor. Most of the people in village Bakhar Jamali work in the farms of the landlords on monthly salary. Other sources of income were working on off farm labor, daily wages and child labor. It was also found that 10% of the respondents were unemployed and had no source of income which causes them to send their children to work.

When asked about monthly income, it was observed that a good majority (30%) was getting Rs.1500 on the average, followed by those earning average Rs.3000 and only 14% were earning Rs.8000 on the average. The overall income was Rs.3350 that is equivalent to \$ 45 per family per month. This reflects the level of poverty in the village and more or less same in other rural areas of Sindh province. The low level income of households also has an impact on sending the children to school and when there is an opportunity people send their boys to school.

As in the area people are more dependent on labor work and daily wage, it also affects on education of the children specially girls. As the data shows that, in the rural areas of this province boys literacy rate is high (54%) of the age of 15 years and 57% in the age on 10 years. While literacy rate among girls of age 10 -15 years is very low that is 18 and 14% respectively.

As income source is labor and daily wages in the village, most of the girls are not attending school and if some of them did attended were discontinued in the middle. While interviewing 50 households, 4 of the households were found in which girls are still continuing their schooling. This clearly demonstrates the low level of discrimination in education for girls.

## 5.1 Socio-Economic Factors influencing Girls Education:

Choose a desk in a primary school in the developing world and the chances are that it will be occupied by a boy.

Many forces combine to influence girls to get education or if some of them are enrolled in the educational programmes, they spell an early end to it. Chief among them is poverty. Even though the primary and secondary education cost is being covered by the FMEWS in the village Bakhar Jamali for girls including free books, uniform etc the cost of voluntary' contributions, uniforms, books, and bus fares can make even free education expensive, especially if there are many children. When a poor family considers how much a daughter can help in cleaning, cooking, collecting wood and water, and looking after younger children, and how little opportunity there will be for her to get a paying job even if she is educated, then the returns rarely seem to warrant the expenditure.

The study has cited the young girls in the village are under the burden of domestic workload like, cooking, cleaning, washing, collecting firewood and taking care of small children at home is hindering them to get education. Girls had to work at home to help them in daily household activities like cooking, cleaning, washing, fetching water, taking care of their brothers and taking care of livestock. It was also observed that girls do have to work at the farm also at the time of harvesting for crop picking etc to earn additional income for livelihood during the school timing due to which they were not able to get education.

Gender disparities in primary and secondary level are significantly seen. According to the study, it was observed that major income source in the village Bakhar Jamali was agricultural labor and daily wages. These sources of income do not provide enough money to the inhabitants of the village for basic needs, food and cloth. Even though they have send children to school boys are more preferred than girls. The parents are illiterate and they have narrow vision about educating girls.

Socially girls are more vulnerable and discriminated and household chores are assumed to be their job. The study reveals that girl's education level depends on household income level. It shows that a household whose income level is higher education level in girls is much higher than the low and medium level income households. This clearly demonstrates some degree of impact on income of household in girl's education.

Similarly the study further confirms that there are more barriers and problems for girl's to get education that are living in low and medium level income household than in high level income households. It shows that in low level income households, 19 girls have never attended school and have nil level of education, where as in medium level of income households, two girls have ever attended the school but discontinued in the middle level of education.

The study reveals that economic factors hinders in the girls level of education. Gender discrimination also affects and results in less opportunity for girls as they have to do household work and on the farm. They study cited that 12 responses were that girls are not educated because they are needed in household activities. Where 10 responses were about girls need at farms where they have to work and earn some income for livelihood. They other responses for factors hindering in the village were about the inappropriate school environment for girls, including curriculum, sanitation, privacy, security. Another important barrier was said to be that school is too far from the village and security conditions are poor on the route which threat them to send their girls to school but are regularly sending boys to school. Girls are considered to get married early in village Bakhar Jamali according to the study which makes parents think that why to invest on girls education eventually she will get married and will her husband and in laws will be benefited not us, so why to invest as she will not get any job for this education.

Furthermore, different reasons were mentioned by different level of income of households. A comparison was made and was found that reasons vary according to the level of income and each of the three level of income household has different perception and problems. For low level income households, it was need of girls at farm activities hinders the girls to get education because they have to earn income for their survival

while for high level income household they considers the school environment for girls as a constraint in their education. It clearly demonstrates that different income level of households has different needs and problems in life and even in girl's education. The study has the evidence that every household regarding it income level has different problems and barriers in girls education.

The study has given evidence that income level of household in the village clearly affects the level of education among girls. According to the data collected there are three levels of income in the village, less than 3000, between 3000 and 5000; the third level is above 5000 till 10000 rupees maximum per month. It was observed that low level income group (<3000), majority has never sent their girls to schools for education. Very few of the Medium level and high level (3000 - 10000) of income group has sent their girls to school but only 1% of female children managed to complete the secondary education.

Mostly, the households in the village got the opportunity to send their children to school, they send their boys and it is usually the daughters who are withdrawn from school. Even when girls are enrolled, the burden of domestic chores stands in the way of educational progress. This study found that the single most important factor in poor performance was the time and strain imposed by the child's workload.

Close behind poverty follows tradition. And perhaps the strongest tradition of all is the idea that sons should be educated because they will be the breadwinners of their own future families, and the supporters of their aging parents. A girl's work, though it may be longer and harder, is considered less likely to bring in monetary income. And in cultures where marriage means that a daughter becomes part of her husband's family, the incentive to educate girls is weaker still.

Yet when asked, many families said that they want their daughters to be educated but cannot send them to school because they are cannot afford. Here the question is how come if they are poor they are able to send their boys to school for education. Many girls stay home, not because parents are poor or culturally intransigent, but because of their perception and believe that education is not so important for girls, as they have to get married and carry on their reproductive role. Another factor is that the education which is being offered is not appropriate for their daughters. School environment is discouraging and the risks are too great in sending their daughter to school. Parents see education of girls as waste of time. The study revealed that investing in girl's education is worthless as there are no job opportunities available for girls who will pass the school.

The results of the study confirmed those risks as real. According to the study, girls are sexually harassed, sometimes raped, by their fellow students, or their teachers, or sometimes by strangers as they walk to school. Girls get pregnant. And these sexual pressures and vulnerability are central to low enrolment and retention rates for girls in the classrooms. Classes are overcrowded, children are poorly supervised, male students are unruly and violent, therefore many girls feel threatened and many parents fear for their safety. No single-sex schools or classes are available, there are no women teachers, and the school is too far from the home or community, therefore female attendance was too low. A study in Egypt, for example, showed that girls' enrolment was at a low 30% when schools were three or more kilometers from the children's homes, but over 70% when the school was located within one kilometer.

Here in village Bakhar Jamali, poverty plays its part in the education of girls. Girls from poor families, constrained by the demands of modesty and propriety, will stay at home. If they do not have adequate sanitary protection, or if their school does not have separate toilets, then the beginning of menstruation can mean the end of a girl's education.

### 5.2 Diverse Educational needs and Interest of Girls:

Improvement in the quality of education is critical to economic and social development, and is therefore a national imperative. Approaches to improving the quality of education require adoption of curriculum content and processes that are learner centered, recognize the diversity of learning needs of boys and girls, social and emotional development, and develop knowledge, skills, and attitudes required for independent learning and problem-solving. Improving the quality of education also requires access to appropriate learning resources. Assessment strategies at all levels should reflect such changing emphases, especially the focus on learning how to learn, and include appropriately diverse, continuous and responsive assessment strategies. Training of teachers and educational managers is required to support curriculum reforms and should include modalities which strengthen teacher monitoring and support mechanisms which ensure continuity of reform.

The study revealed that there are only three formal schools available for primary and secondary education in the village Bakhar Jamali, from which one is government school and two are private schools in which one is run by FMEWS. Education in government schools is cheap but the quality of education is very poor especially in the rural areas. Teachers in the schools treat all students same without considering the diversity in educational needs and interest in of both sexes. Mostly the teachers are not supportive in terms of providing guidance. Sanitation facilities in the schools are worst that is an essential need of girls. There is no separate policy and curriculum for girls which can address their diverse interests. Girl's student needs special attention, guidance and extra tuitions to improve their achievements and confidence than boys as they are neglected in the society.

The study observed that boys are interested in technical subjects while girls are attracted towards social and home management subjects. The education provided in Sindh is similar for both sexes without considering their interests and needs which is also a factor for decrease in girl's interest towards education. In rural slums of Sindh province, girls are famous for their skills on handicrafts, home based products, sewing, painting, carpet making and traditional product making. Some of the areas in Sindh are very famous for these products. These girls earn their income from it. Girls can be attracted through providing them choice of selecting their subjects on arts and craft which is hardly done by any institute in Sindh. These skills they got from their mother and grandmother.

According to the findings of the study girls are under burden on domestic and farm level workload, due to which formal schools are not suitable for such working girls and do not address their need of flexible school timings. As they have to work at home and farm for income they have very less time for education. Therefore non-formal schools can cover this need by providing flexible timing to them. There are very few non-formal schools operational in the province Sindh, and most of them are working in urban or semi urban areas.

The study explored that there are few schools which are only for girls in Sindh. Girls are mostly shy and have lack of confidence due to cultural and traditional norms and belief. They hesitate to speak freely in front of boys and men. Separate school, separate classroom, separate toilet and female teacher are proofed to be the need of girls in a school. Mostly these facilities are not available in schools to address the needs of girls. FMEWS has also providing girls free tuitions, free books, extra tuitions and free uniforms for girls but was failed to understand other needs and interests of girls in village Bakhar Jamali which needs to be addressed.

### 5.3 Role of Institutions in promoting girls education:

The role of government and NGOs is considered to be very important role in promoting education for girls. Government of Sindh is emphasizing on opening schools and making the available schools functional in rural areas of Sindh. Government schools are cheaper and are affordable for poor to send their children to school, although they have failed to provide quality education. Government of Sindh has failed to develop educational policy which can bridge the gender gap in education especially in rural areas of Sindh. The study has proved that schools have failed to address the problems of low literacy rate prevailing in the rural areas of Sindh.

There are few NGOs which are coming forward and trying to reduce gender disparities by studying the factors behind these disparities and trying to implement programmes which can bridge the gender gap in education in the rural areas of Sindh.

According to the responses from the study it was said that Most NGOs educational programs have been limited to opening free schools for poor children specially girls. Recently they have become interested in non-formal education with activities in literacy skills training being limited mostly to urban and semi-urban areas of Punjab province. The study revealed some examples from the Punjab province where these institutions are working for promotion of girl's education, but no significant example was given in Sindh province. It shows the lack of attention towards this province in terms of girl's education.

The study provided an example of Punjab Social Services Board (PSSB), which was said to be outstanding, rurally based agency that delivers two non-formal educational programs out of literacy centers in villages of Punjab. The programmes delivered by PSSB are said to be great demand and were effective.

The National Education Policy 1998-2010 lays out the need for higher rates of literacy and increased emphasis on providing education for all. It emphasizes that non-formal systems should be adopted to complement the formal system. Non-formal education for rural women is also an important pillar in the poverty reduction strategy of the Federal Government and of the provincial government of Punjab province.

It was found that non-formal education can be effective to educate girls in village Bakhar Jamali. There are many types of non-formal education, here only three were discussed that were distance learning, home based schools, mobile schools. It was found that distance learning cannot be introduced in rural areas because of non availability of infrastructure and resources like electricity and television. While mobile schools and home based schools can be introduced but it requires adequate funding to make it sustainable and that is always a problem to get.

### 5.4 Strategies for Girls Education in Village Bakhar Jamali:

The study explored the strategies that should be implemented from inside or outside the classroom for the girl's education in village Bakhar Jamali and other rural areas of Sindh province. Each should promote in its own way the model of a school that should seek to ensure effective learning in safe, healthy gender sensitive and child-centered environments. Governments should undertake an analysis of the particular barriers facing girls as a necessary prelude to selecting a package of the most appropriate interventions. An opinion poll of the perceptions of parents of those barriers played an important part in such an analysis. Making education free and compulsory is the keystone of any national plan to eliminate gender disparity in education and achieve universal education. Faced with an economically driven choice between sending sons or daughters to school, poor families often send their sons. Removing fees or offering financial support to families with daughters in school, as well as explaining the advantages of sending girls to school, can make a real difference.

They study cited that most of the girls in the village Bakhar Jamali are under the domestic and farm level work load which do not able attend the school. It was felt important to decrease the domestic workload and also providing alternative education for girls through education centers establishing outside the formal school system which should encourage girls normally confined to the home and domestic labor. It was suggested to schedule lessons flexibly because children are often excluded from school because of family responsibilities or the homework that is more often allocated to girls than boys. Schools should give priority to girls and design a flexible school schedule for them

Decreasing the domestic workload; many girls are kept at home to help with domestic tasks. Supplying communities or women's groups with equipment such as mills to grind cereals, huskers, carts and plastic barrels for water conservation, can decrease the amount of work to be done so that girls can be freed to attend school. Girls may also be prevented from going to school because they have to fetch water from a traditional well.

The study provides need for taking special measures to reach the most disadvantaged girls people living in rural areas of Sindh and the poor face discrimination and exclusion, girls often suffer a multiple disadvantage because of their gender. The more disadvantaged the girl, the more essential it is that the education system should reach out to her through special measures, rather than just assuming she will be drawn in as part of a general drive for education for all.

According to the study providing alternative education for girls is one way of reaching girls who have dropped out of school, as well as other groups such as working children, is through education centers established outside the formal school system which should encourage girls normally confined to the home and domestic labor, to enroll in 'open primary school'. The centers should perform an invaluable social as well as educational function. Also for overage female children, it should provide basic education through a specially designed three year course, at the end of which children are eligible to join the mainstream school system. Girls should be given special focus due to their low

enrolment rates. Reaching excluded or 'hidden' groups of children, including orphans, children of single parents and young mothers.

The problem of school being far taken by study and revealed that locating schools closer to children's homes, establishing small multi-grade or multiage schools in remote rural areas for girls are appropriate measures, as they are less likely to make long journey from home to school. Not least because of concerns about their safety en route. Developing a network of 'satellite schools' and Home based school with consultation with the village inhabitants. A house should be selected by the consent of all where they can send their girls for education. A teacher should be appointed and sent there to teach them.

They study cited insecurity in village Bakhar Jamali which is another constraint in the education of girls. It suggested for making sure girls and boys are safe. This involves making schools secure not only from without perimeter walls have, for example, it has been found increase girls' sense of safety by some of the inhabitants in the village Bakhar Jamali. Education is a key to protection when it is of good quality, but falls short when the learning environment itself fails to provide the necessary protection against violence and abuse of girl children. When schools are associated with sexual or physical gender violence, girls' access to education is negatively affected. Parents will naturally hesitate to send their daughters to schools that are thought to be sites of physical or sexual gender violence.18 years Boys and girls are often susceptible to psychological and physical violence in different ways, and adolescents in particular can find themselves especially vulnerable to violations of their safety. Lack of safety and security in the school environment may be very obvious in terms of physical danger, such as beatings or rape. The abuse of girls – sexual, physical and emotional – by teachers is a common problem. Breaking the silence about violence at school is an important step towards its diagnosis and prevention.

The study explored that parents perceive that education is not important for girls as they are not breadwinners and they have to play reproductive role and get married. Awareness raising trainings should be conducted to make them gender sensitized according to literature in chapter 2 otherwise no intervention can help to achieve gender equality and parity in education.

It was revealed that many parents are not satisfied with the school environment and considered it discouraging and inappropriate for girls. It was suggested by the respondents to separate schools and separate toilets should be provided or girls. Schools are not providing quality education and curriculum of the school is not suitable for girls. It is confirmed by the literature that school environment makes a big difference in attendance, participation and achievement of girls therefore making the classroom more child-centered and gender-sensitive and rooted in the life and environment of the area and introducing participatory teaching and learning techniques can play a role in improving the environment on interest of topics of girl's can attract them. Teachers make full use of local languages and culture that have in the past been marginalized despite their importance.

The study emphasis on importance should given on recruiting and training teachers on gender and child rights, and paying them a regular, living wage so that they can provide

better services. Recruit more women teachers who can serve as role models for girls and may make girls' parents feel more comfortable.

The study revealed that eliminating gender bias from textbooks and learning materials, apart from the obvious value to girls, the thoughtful revision of textbooks, classroom materials and lesson plans is likely to increase their quality and relevance to the lives of all children. Government of Sindh is developing new gender sensitive teacher-training modules, ensuring that future textbooks are gender neutral, and providing training in gender which should be tested and implemented in schools.

Many girls drop out of school at the onset of menstruation, partly because there are no separate toilet facilities. Sometimes it is not enough simply to provide the latrines, however. Girls' involvement in identifying their location and type can be critical in determining whether they will be used due to inadequate sanitation facilities. The study expressed the importance of supplying safe water and latrines for girls participation in educational programmes.

# **CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

Gender inequality can be seen in education level of country especially in Sindh Province. Girls are deprived of getting educational opportunities. The findings concludes that the constraints for girls in village Bakhar Jamali, who are not attending schools and have never got any education comparing with those who have ever attended schools and got a part of education but not completely are more or less similar. The factors hindering girls to get education depends on the level of income of the households. It also indicates that not only economic constraints deprive girls to get education but social, physical and physiological factors also hinder them to get education.

Girls are under burden of domestic and farm level work load which are the main constraints in their education and dropping out in the middle of the education process. Schools' being too far is another major constraint for parents to send their female children to school as they are afraid of sexual harassment and kidnaps. Early marriages are making to the girls to discontinue their education in the middle which is another barrier in girl's education.

The perception of parents that girl's education is not important for them as they have to get married and play reproductive role only is one of the important finding and constraint in the girl's education in the village Bakhar Jamali. It does not allow girls to go to school or participate in other programmes of education. Girls are not considered as breadwinners therefore boys are preferred to send to schools for education as they don't see any importance of education for girl. It was concluded that whatever measures will be taken to promote girls education will not work until parent's perception and thinking will not be changed. It can be done by together with girls parents should also be motivated by giving trainings on gender sensitivity and importance of education for girls.

Moreover, girl's educational needs and interests being not considered by the institutions is another hurdle in their education. Institutions and schools have failed to attract girls to get education as their needs and interests in terms of physical needs and educational interests both. Physical facilities are not provided in schools for girls for example, separate toilets, classrooms, female teacher etc. Poor quality of education and gender insensitive curriculum is the part of existing educational system especially in rural areas restricts girls to go to school for education.

However, many government organizations and NGOs suggest alternative education system for the girls in rural areas like home based schools, mobile schools and flexible schools according to their timing. Where distance learning is not considered suitable for the rural areas because of lack of infrastructure. Where mobile schools are considered the best alternative for girls in rural areas of Sindh and village Bakhar Jamali but again the question is raised about sustainability of such alternative educational programmes and resources together with funds availability. Considering that in many disadvantaged areas of Punjab, particularly the rural parts, non-formal schools are not an alternative, but rather, the only option children have to gain basic education and literacy skills.

It is concluded that non-formal schools for girls be established in different parts of Sindh province and also in village Bakhar Jamali which will work together with formal schools by providing education and also motivating student to transfer in formal schools.

#### **Recommendations:**

Recommendations are given basing on the findings of the study, literature review and in my own reflection. Here recommendations are presented as strategies which can be implemented by the FMEWS and other organizations working for the promotion of girls education is rural areas of Sindh province.

The study explored the strategies that should be implemented from inside or outside the classroom for the girl's education in village Bakhar Jamali and other rural areas of Sindh province. Each should promote in its own way the model of a school that should seek to ensure effective learning in safe, healthy gender sensitive and child-centered environments.

Governments should undertake an analysis of the particular barriers facing girls as a necessary prelude to selecting a package of the most appropriate interventions. An opinion poll of the perceptions of parents of those barriers played an important part in such an analysis.

Education should be made free at primary and secondary level in rural areas of Sindh and improving quality of education. Measures should be taken in terms of establishing monitoring and evaluation system on educational programmes.

Classrooms should be made more child-centered and gender-sensitive and rooted in the life and environment of the area. Participatory teaching and learning techniques should be adopted, with play and study creatively combined including skill development on interest of topics of girl's. Teachers should make full use of local languages and culture that have in the past been marginalized despite their importance

Recruiting and training of teachers should be done by hiring teachers who are sensitive to gender and child rights, and paying them a regular, living wage so that they can provide better services. Both female and male teachers should receive training in gender awareness in the classroom.

Eliminating gender bias from textbooks and learning materials, apart from the obvious value to girls, the thoughtful revision of textbooks, classroom materials and lesson plans is likely to increase their quality and relevance to the lives of all children.

Scheduling lessons flexibly; Children are often excluded from school because of family responsibilities or the homework that is more often allocated to girls than boys. Schools should give priority to girls and design a flexible school schedule for them

Providing alternative education for girls who have dropped out of school, as well as other groups such as working children through establishing education centers outside the formal school system which should encourage girls normally confined to the home and domestic labor, to enroll in 'open primary school'. The centers should perform an invaluable social as well as educational function.

Locating schools in middle of the villages: Establishing small schools in remote rural areas for girls, as they are less likely to make long journey from home to school. Not least because of concerns about their safety en route. Developing a network of 'satellite schools and Home based school should be established with consultation with the village

inhabitants. A house should be selected by the consent of all where they can send their girls for education. A teacher should be appointed and sent there to teach them.

Making sure girls and boys are safe. This involves making schools secure not only from without perimeter walls. It has been found increase girls' sense of safety by some of the inhabitants in the village Bakhar Jamali.

The schools should provide separate building, classrooms and toilets for girls.

Effort should be made on decreasing the domestic and farm level workload of girls as many girls are kept at home to help with domestic tasks by supplying equipment to women such as mills to grind cereals, huskers, carts and plastic barrels for water conservation, which can decrease the amount of work to be done so that girls can be freed to attend school.

A part from all these above recommended strategies for girl's education the most important one is to educate parents of girls and motivate them to send their girls children to schools. Provide gender sensitive trainings for parents to change their perception about importance of education for girls otherwise no strategy can help to improve the literacy rate among girls in rural slums.

## **Bibliography and References:**

Aggarwal, Y.P.,1988.Research in Emerging Fields of Education.Sterling Publishers, New Dehli.pp.17-18

Aly, J.H. 2007. Education in Pakistan: A White Paper (Revised). Documentation to Debate and Finalize the National Education Policy. Islamabad: Government of Pakistan, National Education Policy Review Team

Andrabi, T.et.al.,2005. "Private Schooling: Limits and Possibilities." Joint paper. Pomona College, World Bank, Harvard University.

Annes, M., 2005.Comparison of Formal and Non-Formal System of Teachers Education in Pakistan.University Institute of Education and Research, University of Arid Agriculture Rawalpindi, Pakistan.

Bano, M.,2007. Country profile prepared for the *Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2008 Education for All by 2015: will we make it?* Pakistan country case study. United Nations Educational, scientific and cultural Organization. UNESCO.

Coombs, P. and Ahmed, M., 1973. New Paths to learning for rural children and Youth. NewYork. ICED.p-10-11.

Federal Bureau Of Statistics., 1998. Pakistan Integrated Household Survey Round 2. Government of Pakistan.

Government of Pakistan.,1999.Report of the National Workshop on Non-Formal Education.Ministry of Education, Islamabad.p.40-42

Government of Pakistan and UNESCO. 2005. Non-Formal Basic Education: News & Views., Issue 1. Islamabad: Project Wing, Ministry of Education.

Ghaus-Pasha, A., Jamad, H. and Iqbal, M.A. 2002. Dimensions of the Nonprofit Sector in Pakistan. SPDC Working Paper No. 1. Karachi: SPDC.

Holmes, J.,2003. "Measuring the Determinants of School Completion in Pakistan: Analysis of Censoring and Selection Bias". Economics of Education Review 22.

Husain, F. and Qasim, M. A. 2005. Inequality in the Literacy Levels in Pakistan: Existence and Changes Overtime. *South Asia Economic.* Journal. 6:2.

ITA. 2005. Process, Criteria and Rules for Identification of at Risk Children: Pre-Testing in Five Government Primary Schools in District Kasur and Sheikhpura. Internal Review Document. Lahore: ITA.

Kakuru, D and Muhwezi.,2003.Gender Sensitive Educational Policy and Practice: Uganda Case study.International Bureau of Education.

Kasente, D.,2003.Gender and Education in Uganda: A Case Study for Monitoring Report.Makerere University.

Kelsey, I.B., 1993. Universal Character Education. The pent land press Ltd, Durham.p.3

Memon, G.R., 2007. New Challenges. *Management and Social Sciences*. Department of Education, University of Karachi, 3 (1), p. 47-55.

Ministry of Education (MoE). 2006b. National Education Census: District Education Statistics. Islamabad: Ministry of Education.

Ministry of Finance (MoF). 2006b. Economic Survey 2006-07. Islamabad: Ministry of Finance, Government of Pakistan.

Odaga, A. & Heneveld, W.,1995. Girls and Schools in Sub-Saharan Africa: From Analysis to Issues in Basic Education in Developing Countries. An Exploration of Policy Options for Improved Delivery to Action. Technical Paper no.298. Washington DC: The World Bank.

Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement Survey (PSLM) 2004-05. Table 2.14a Literacy – *Population 10 Years and Older. Available at:* <u>http://www.statpak.gov.pk/depts/fbs/statistics/pslm0405district/table2.14a.pdf</u>. [Accessed: 28 June, 2008]

Sarwar, M. B. 2006. Sharing Practices for Educational Change. Karachi: Sindh Education Foundation.

Serpell, R.,1993. The Significance of Schooling. Life Journeys in an African Society. Cambridge University Press

Shami, P.A. and Hussain, 2006. Learning Achievement: Quantitative and Qualitative Data. Islamabad: Academy of Education Planning and Management, Ministry of Education, Pakistan.

Siddiqui, S.A., 1990. Trends and Issues in Education. Study Guide for M.Phil. (Edu.) AIOU, Islamabad, p.15.

SPDC.,2002. Human Development Report Social Policy and Development Centre, Islamabad.

UNESCO. 2006. EFA Global Monitoring Report 2007. Strong Foundations: Early Childhood Care and Education. Paris: UNESCO.

UNESCO & Secondary Education, n.d. The United Nation Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization. Available at <u>http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php</u> [Accessed: 30 June,2008]

UNESCO, 2008.Gender Parity in Education: NOT THERE YET.UNESCO Institute for Statistics.No1. Available at:<u>http://www.uis.unesco.org/template/pdf/</u> [accessed 30 June,2008]

World Bank, 1996. "Leveling the playing Field: Giving girls Equal Chance for Basic Education-Three Countries Efforts". Economic Development Institute.

World Bank. 2005. Bringing the Little Girls of Pakistan to School: Punjab Province Leads the Way. World Bank Pakistan website. Avialable at : <u>http://devdata.worldbank.org/genderstats/,Pakistan [</u>Accessed: 28 June, 2008]

Zafar, F. & Rashid, A. 2003. A Report on the Status and Role of Education NGOs in the Punjab. Lahore: Sahe.