Christian values in the EU mindset

Thesis: To what extent did Christian thinking have an influence on European integration?

Name: Martijn van Luenen
Student number: 09054510
Class: ES4-5
Supervisor: dr. M. Krijtenburg
Date of submission: 13-06-2014
Academy of European Studies & Communication Management
The Hague University of Applied Sciences

This research report is conducted and written by

Martijn van Luenen   European Studies 4   09054510

Executive Summary

The goal of this research was to investigate to what extent Christian thinking influenced the European integration after the Second World War. Christian thinking refers to values embedded within the Christian mindset. The reason for this research was the Nobel Peace Prize received by the European Union (EU). Aside from this, dr. M. Krijtenburg's research on Robert Schuman, one of the main architects of the European unification project, was also a push factor for this thesis.

The research method was desk research using literature review. Furthermore, experts familiar with Christianity and European integration were consulted. Nonetheless, literature review was the guiding method of this thesis.

Key concepts of the European integration process are: human dignity, reconciliation, supranational thinking and subsidiarity. These key concepts are embedded in Christian thinking, as part of the spiritual and cultural European heritage. The European cultural heritage was arguably a main source of inspiration for the founding fathers of the European unification process.

The human rights charter (1948) defined human dignity. Philosophers and theologians from all over the world influenced in this way the theory and image of human dignity today. Human dignity could not be regarded as a specific Christian notion. However, Christian thinking has had an influence on how this value is perceived.

The value of reconciliation might have been a consequence of the common spiritual and cultural European heritage. It helped to achieve peace on the continent. Furthermore, this value may also be seen as an incentive to live in effective solidarity and put the common interest in coal and steel under supervision of a supranational high authority (ECSC).

The EU is a supranational organization. After the decline of the Roman Empire (4th – 5th century) Christianity remained the dominating religion in Europe. Although essentially different from state-supranationality, the organizational Catholic Church (encompassing Christianity) was arguably the first supranational organization. Furthermore, after the Second World War the Catholic Church was in favor of a supranational body which could help

keeping the continent in peace (Pius XII, 1944). It should be noted that by that time the Catholic Church was the only organization adopting supranationality. The supranational aspect of the Catholic Church was an inspiration for the EU; however, it was not modeled after its organization.

The final value which characterized European integration is subsidiarity (Henkel, 2002). The principle of subsidiarity was mentioned for the first time by St. Thomas Aquinas (13th century, Thomas). It belongs to Catholic social teaching and was first clearly formulated by Pius XI in *Quadragesimo Anno.* It was later further developed by other popes explaining how political (and governmental) functions should be organized. This theory belongs to the essential concepts of European integration. The principle of subsidiarity is clearly formulated in the Treaty on European Union (TEU, art. 5 (3)). According to the subsidiarity principle, decisions must be taken in the lowest level of governance as possible.

When looking at these four values which might have been of importance for the European unification process and European integration, it becomes clear that Christianity could have played a role. European integration might not be a Christian process; however, the discussed values are intrinsically connected with Christianity. Combining the Christian culture with the importance of Christianity in Europe was of great help shaping the European integration process. This, combined with the overall Christian culture and the importance of Christianity in Europe helped shape the process. In the context of the European unification process further research would be valuable to determine the extent of the influence of Christian thinking.

Foreword

This thesis is studying European integration from a Christian point of view.
The author's affinity for Christian teachings comes from his involvement in various activities and events in the field. During such events, the author learned about the influence of the Christian values on the European integration process. Religion is an important aspect of culture and is chosen to be researched to a greater extent. The study is chosen because throughout history Christianity has an influence on politics.

It must be admitted that my knowledge about Christianity is mostly autodidactic. However, I have followed a minor that dealt with religion. While my research progressed, I became increasingly more acquainted with Christianity and its influence on the European integration. The dissertation became more interesting and fascinating along the way. I am very pleased to say that at the end of the research, my knowledge about Christianity is deepened and introduced me to new values.

I would like to thank the following people who were of assistance and with whom I had experienced good communication while conducting the research.

My supervisor, dr. M. Krijtenburg who has been of great help, by not only giving me insights on how to conduct the research, but also on Christianity itself.

Ms. E. C. J. Nieuweboer, who has introduced me to Dr. Krijtenburg and helped me guide my project when it was a mere thought experiment.

Mr. D. van Ginhoven, who sparked my interest in Christianity even more when teaching his course Religious Iconography.

Prof. dr. Ir. J. J. C. Voorhoeve, who has helped me seeing many reference points of religion in contemporary society.

Em. prof. dr. A. Driessen, for inspirational discussions about Christianity.

Dr. D. van Schalkwijk, for inspirational discussions about Christianity.

Table of Contents

1. Introduction

Since the EU received the Nobel Peace Prize in 2012, the European Union (EU) got the recognition it deserved. From its early beginnings (1950), the EU helped build and maintain peace in a continent torn by wars over the past centuries. Christianity can be accounted for many aspects of European culture and mindset. Throughout history, the influence of Christianity has been evident in various social spheres. For instance, Christianity was instrumental for social areas such as education (e.g. Christian schools), care (e.g. Salvation Army), law (e.g. legislation on marriage, blasphemy), art (e.g. high renaissance) and architecture (e.g. churches).

This research aimed to illustrate the connection between Christian values and their contribution to the EU integration process. For this reason the main research question addresses the extent of the influence of Christian thinking in EU integration. In order to assess this influence, different Christian values are analyzed in relation to the EU integration process. It may be argued that these values are present in Christianity. Thus, reconciliation, human dignity, supranational thinking, subsidiarity and the influence of the founding fathers (mainly Schuman) might have helped to achieve peace in the torn 'by war after war' continent.

The motivation for the research is to deepen the knowledge of the reader about the roots of the before mentioned values. Furthermore, it may be relevant in broadening the knowledge of Christianity. It may help the reader get a better grasp of the values that left their traces in the EU mindset. It is important that European citizens know where the long term peace in Europe stems from. Furthermore, deeper knowledge about European culture, of which Christianity is a substantial part, is very relevant for young generations because it will help them to understand where the roots of current society stem from.

Post Second World War Europe is an extensively researched topic. However, this research is usually not tied to faith or religion. The EU and its predecessors were not religious organizations, however there seems to be a connection between the Christian values, the EU and its predecessors.

Solidarity is a value that will not be approached within this thesis. The importance of solidarity for European integration and its connection with Christianity are evident. This would be a topic that would require research on its own.

As mentioned before, this research tries to connect Christianity to European integration while acknowledging that the EU and its predecessors are not Christian projects. The values discussed are values that might have influenced the founding fathers.

Additional Notes

Dr. M. Krijtenburg has been the supervisor of this research. She was informed on a regular basis from start to finish and it was possible to contact her with any questions or additional information. Contact details of the supervisor can be found below.

Dr. M. Krijtenburg. Faculty of ESCM, the Hague University of Applied Sciences. g.krijtenburg@hhs.nl

Regarding research methods, most of the sources used were acquired through desk research. In addition, several conferences and informal discussions with experts in various fields served as the pillars for enriching existing knowledge.

2. Research methods and resources

As previously mentioned, when conducting the study, the emphasis was put on literature research. Furthermore, experts and scholars of the EU and theology proved of essential value for this dissertation. Since this research is about the connection of Christian values with the EU, it was important to consult not only academic writing, but also scripture and the teachings of the Roman Catholic Church. Furthermore, it is of utmost importance that the readers interpret the present study and theology from a Christian perspective. Thus, it will strengthen their understanding of the present research.

Using an interpretative research philosophy, this study emphasizes a longitudinal time horizon covering the history of the European Union development, from a social constructivist perspective. Starting with an inductive research approach, the present thesis used literature collection to show the influence of the Christian values in the framework of the EU. Focusing on the inductive approach of the thesis, specific reference must be acknowledged to dr. Krijtenburg's book, 'Schuman: His frame of reference', which was of substantial inspiration, especially for the part on Robert Schuman.

Data collection was composed of desk research, observations drawn from conferences and informal talks with experts in the field. In fact, data collection has combined primary sources (speeches-conferences and informal talks), secondary sources (text books, newspapers, the Bible) for a broader investigation of the case. Thus, the overall research strategies are highlighted by case studies and theory based research.

Specific search engines like LexisNexis and Scirus were consulted. These search engines were used to find scientific documents regarding theology and the EU.
The 'The Hague University HBO Kennisbank' was used to find examples of research reports.

Field research

The field research consisted of visiting conferences that related to the topic of this dissertation. Conferences visited include:
- Cultuur van Europa 3 (2 February 2013)

- Ik, wij en de Europese Unie. Schumans kijk op Europese eenwording. (4 September 2013)

These events, which dealt with European integration, were useful to receive additional information about European integration next to the literature research. The conference Cultuur van Europa 3 also dealt with the influence of Christianity on the unification process and integration. Values as reconciliation and subsidiarity were discussed which proved to broaden the knowledge and assisted in seeing these values from a Christian perspective. Ik, wij en de Europese Unie was a conference about Schuman's influence on the unification process. This conference helped to write the part about Robert Schuman and the part about reconciliation.

Discussions about Christianity were held with em. Prof. dr. Albert Driessen which were very inspirational, educational and of overall assistance when conducting the research.

3. EU and the Nobel Peace Prize

October 12, 2012, was a historical day in Europe, the life of European citizens and the EU. On that day, Nobel Committee chairman Thorbjørn Jagland announced that the Nobel Peace Prize was awarded to the EU. This decision was unanimous.

The decision to award the Nobel Prize to the EU was based on the fact that the EU and its predecessors managed to prevent war between member states from occurring. This is the reason why, nowadays large scale wars (i.e. between Germany and France) between EU member states cannot occur anymore (Van Rompuy, 2012). In the press release, dated October 12, 2012, the Nobel Prize Committee stated that: "The union and its forerunners have for over six decades contributed to the advancement of peace and reconciliation, democracy and human rights in Europe" (Nobel Prize Committee, 2012). After the Second World War, reconciliation was a substantial part of foreign politics. European leaders were committed to prevent a war of large proportions. This was illustrated by the leaders' efforts in their initiative to prevent large scale wars, e.g. Schuman through the Schuman plan. The cooperation in the field of coal and steel, which was the main goal of the plan, would make war "not merely unthinkable, but materially impossible" (Schuman, 1950). Overall they succeeded, as no war happened between EU member states since the Second World War. The importance of European peace was understood by influential European thinkers and politicians (Monnet, Schuman) at the time. For instance, the importance of EU peace was highlighted through the incorporation of atomic regulations within EEC treaties (1957 and on).

As first argued by Kant in 1795 (Doyle, 1983), according to the democratic peace theory, democracies do not go into war with each other. Therefore, it was vital that after the Second World War every European country would become a democracy. After Schuman's death, democracy started to spread in Europe (1963). Spain, Yugoslavia and the DDR needed more time because of Franco's dictatorship, Tito's communist Yugoslavian republics and the Soviet rule, which was dominant in the DDR. "The fall of the Berlin wall (1989) followed by the unification of Germany due to the communist reforms made democracy possible in the former Soviet states" (Sakwa, Stevens, 2006). In the press release, the Nobel Prize Committee states: "The fall of the Berlin Wall made EU membership possible for several Central and Eastern European countries, thereby opening a new era in European history.

The division between East and West has to a large extent been brought to an end; democracy has been strengthened; many ethnically-based national conflicts have been settled'' (Nobel Prize Committee, 2012).

In the acceptance speech, President Van Rompuy stated "War is as old as Europe. Our continent bears the scars of spears and swords, canons and guns, trenches and tanks, and more. Yet, … after two terrible wars engulfed the continent and the world with it, … finally lasting peace came to Europe(...)In those grey days, its cities were in ruins, the hearts of many still simmering with mourning and resentment. So what a bold bet it was, for Europe's Founders, to say, yes, we can break this endless cycle of violence, we can stop the logic of vengeance, we can build a brighter future, together. What power of the imagination.'' (Van Rompuy, 2012). In a continent where war has always been a blink of an eye away, European leaders had the courage to step up. Schuman understood that a "different kind of politics were needed to end the cycle of war and revenge with Germany" (Ginsberg, 2007). Germany and France, who had been involved in wars with each other for years, decided it was time for not only reconciliation, but also cooperation. Van Rompuy states: "To me, what makes it so special, is reconciliation. In politics as in life, reconciliation is the most difficult thing. It goes beyond forgiving and forgetting, or simply turning the page. But the will to not let history repeat itself, to do something radically new, was so strong that new words had to be found.'' (Van Rompuy, 2012). But mere reconciliation between Germany and France was not enough. Germany was still divided and Soviet rule dictated politics in large portions of Europe. Meanwhile Europe progressed, removing internal market borders and creating new treaties, and even laying a framework for common security and economic policy. After the fall of the Berlin Wall European integration was not to be stopped. Everlasting European peace was an ideal from the Schuman declaration onwards and was now reality. The European Coal and Steel Community (ECSC) was the first step towards effective solidarity in the field of economics on a supranational level.

This cooperation had been deepened through the last five decades. Van Rompuy states: "This is where the European Union's "secret weapon" comes into play: an unrivalled way of binding our interests so tightly that war becomes materially impossible'' (Van Rompuy, 2012). One does not go to war when one is dependent of the other. EU member states are all interconnected and rely on each other, whether it is through the monetary union or security treaties. Europe is not a continent of conflict anymore and there is an incredible amount of collaboration between the member states and their citizens.

4. Robert Schuman's (Catholic) influence on European integration

Robert Schuman is arguably the most important architect of European integration in history. His Schuman Declaration helped to create the European Union as we know it today. He was a man with great intellect and blessed with the task to strengthen political synchronization between European countries. He was suitable for the job, as stated in the thesis 'Schuman's Europe; his frame of reference', by Margriet Krijtenburg: "He was a man of his region, Lorraine, a region which throughout history was contested by Germany and France. He was trilingual and experienced the Luxembourgish, French and German culture and was therefore well aware of not only cultural differences but also cultural similarities. Robert Schuman, as a practicing Catholic, was a man of very high morals, and lived his profession with the utmost integrity.'' (Krijtenburg, 2012, p.26). This cultural awareness undoubtedly helped Schuman in his reconciliation politics later in his life.

Because Robert Schuman was a convinced Catholic, this had extensive influence on his way of thinking, not only about Europe, but about life in general. In Catholicism, where reconciliation and forgiveness are a central part of the faith, Robert Schuman integrated these morals in his politics. As mentioned before, the EU could not have come so far without reconciliation, in particular between Germany and France. European unification could only be achieved when Germany and France reconciled after the Second World War and it was therefore an essential aspect of the Schuman declaration (1950). Krijtenburg states: "During his (Schuman) university studies (1904-1910) he became a (lifelong) member of the Catholic Society *Unitas.* Its motto was 'unity in necessary things; liberty when there is doubt; charity in all things'. This motto seems to characterize the European thought Schuman would promote later on as we will see when dealing with the foundations of European integration.'' (Krijtenburg, 2012, p.35). Unity in all necessary things was something that belongs to the philosophy on European unification according to Schuman. First the aspects that were absolutely vital, such as the reconciliation between Germany and France. Thereby using the ECSC as a first step of effective solidarity. Slowly there was a synchronization of many other aspects of politics, economics and cultural sectors. Schuman stated: "Europe will not be made all at once, or according to a single, general plan. It will be built to concrete achievements, which first create a de facto solidarity" (Pinder, Usherwood, 2007).This clearly illustrates that Schuman already knew the unification was a process which would not happen all at once.

Schuman had a crucial moment in his personal life when his mother passed away and he asked himself what God wanted from him. He was in doubt whether he had the calling of priesthood or if he should remain a lay person. "Eschbach made a remark that changed the life of Robert Schuman. He commented that the saints of the future, will be 'saints in suits'. Eschbach encouraged him to go for the lay-apostolate. According to him Schuman should help to change the world from within and make it a better place to live, as this would suit him perfectly." (Krijtenburg, 2012). This remark and its effect on Schuman became the guidance of his adult life. Schuman, without being a member of the clergy, went on to lead several (Catholic) organizations and became strongly influenced by philosophy. He studied Thomas Aquinas's *Summa Theologiae* and became familiar with his teachings on harmony and conciliation, which translated itself in Schuman's reconciliation policy between Germany and France.

After the First World War, his political career began with local governance in Metz. He quickly rose up the ranks and became a member of parliament (1919). He put the social doctrine of the Catholic Church and its subsidiarity principle into practice when he safeguarded the specific regional interest of Alsace-Lorraine when he had to adopt the regional laws to the laws of the central government. He formulated the 'lex Schuman' which allowed religious education in certain public schools. After the Second World War he would led two French cabinets and was minister of Foreign Affairs from 1948 till 1953.

Robert Schuman was a man of faith, a noble, sincere man with great integrity, he was motivated to lead the way for German and French reconciliation. This reconciliation would be the foundation of a peaceful Europe and served as a basis for the EU. The thought comes to mind that he was not only a politician of France, but a politician for the entire continent and a politician of peace.

5. Human dignity

One of the key concepts of European integration was, among others, human dignity, illustrated clearly by the European Commission stating: "The Union is founded on the values of respect for human dignity, liberty, democracy, equality, the rule of law and respect for human rights, including the rights of persons belonging to minorities" (EC). It had been over 60 years that the Universal Declaration of Human Rights was adopted by the General Assembly (1948). During the Second World War "national and international pressure had been steadily building for such a bill" (J. Morsink, 1999). The Declaration was created because of the Second World War, clearly illustrated by the United Nations, stating that: "With the end of that war, and the creation of the United Nations, the international community vowed never again to allow atrocities like those of that conflict happen again. World leaders decided to complement the UN Charter with a road map to guarantee the rights of every individual everywhere." (UN) Definitions of human dignity might be based on the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. This study will reflect more specifically on the concept of human dignity.

Human dignity is an essential aspect of each human being. It expresses that humans have an intrinsic value and should therefore be treated appropriately. This principle could also strengthen the importance of reconciliation. Furthermore, it defines humans in every aspect, for example, being worthy. "The value of human dignity denotes worthiness" (Cancik, 2001). The Roman philosopher Cicero might have been the first who conceptualized dignity of humans to the impression we have of this concept today. He argued that humans differ from animals because of reason. Humans are superior to animals because men have the ability to reason and think beyond natural urges. He states: "it is vitally necessary for us to remember always how vastly superior is man's nature to that of cattle and other animals; their only thought is for bodily satisfactions … . Man's mind, on the contrary, is developed by study and reflection … . From this we may learn that sensual pleasure is wholly unworthy of the dignity of the human race'' (Cicero, 44 BC). This illustrates that even in the antiquity human dignity was already studied. Furthermore, it illustrates an enlightenment aspect because of man's mind being developed by study and reflection.

Human dignity is also a key aspect in Christianity. Daniel Groody, associate professor of Theology at the University of Notre Dame, states: "Catholic social teaching believes that human beings, created in the image and likeness of God (Genesis 1:26-27), have by their very existence an inherent value, worth, and distinction. This means that God is present in every person, regardless of his or her race, nation, sex, origin, orientation, culture, or economic standing."(Groody, 2007, p.109) This illustrates that the dignity of the person does not necessarily come from reason, which is Cicero's argument, but because God is present in every person. But would the absence of God in a person mean that the person has no 'human dignity'? This is hard to 'prove' since the argument is that God lives in every person. Furthermore, it is just as hard to 'prove' whether the absence of reason in a person would mean that the person has no 'human dignity' because every human has reason (excluding humans with specific disorders), which separates humans from animals. Therefore, Groody and Cerero agree on the point that human dignity is present in every person. The difference is the source of this dignity.

One of the official Catholic Church writings, the catechism, defines human dignity as follows: "The dignity of the human person is rooted in his creation in the image and likeness of God (*article 1*); it is fulfilled in his vocation to divine beatitude (*article 2*). It is essential to a human being freely to direct himself to this fulfillment (*article 3*). By his deliberate actions (*article 4*), the human person does, or does not, conform to the good promised by God and attested by moral conscience (*article 5*). Human beings make their own contribution to their interior growth; they make their whole sentient and spiritual lives into means of this growth (*article 6*)." (Catechism of the Catholic Church, 1997). Since man is created in the image of God, and other species, such as animals, are not, Catholic teaching argues that, like Cicero, dignity can be used to distinguish the species from one another. Furthermore, in contrast to other species, man can have a personal relationship with God. The catechism states: "Of all visible creatures only man is 'able to know and love his creator '. He is 'the only creature on earth that God has willed for its own sake', and he alone is called to share, by knowledge and love, in God's own life. It was for this end that he was created, and this is the fundamental reason for his dignity" (Catechism of the Catholic Church, 1997). This illustrates that the Church does not only see human dignity in a person as a result of God being existent in every person but also by his ability to share, have knowledge and love, which are also things that separates man from animal. The official teachings of the church make a combination of Cicero's argument and common theological arguments like Groody's, stating that, humans have human dignity because of God and because of reason.

Reason, as Cicero states, is the aspect that separates man from animals. The dignity and reason of man is connected. "Reason became closely related to dignity" (McCrudden, 2008). Reason is a gift from God to men, the ability to choose one's own path of righteousness, faith and salvation. Reason humanist scholar Pico della Mirandola argues: "It is given to him to have that which he chooses and to be that which he wills" (della Mirandola, 1486). Reason is what separates man from animal and gives him worthiness (Cicero) or God is present in every person and gives him worthiness (Groody, Aquinas). Then the argument can be made, that reason is given to man by God, which implies therefore that God is the original source of the worthiness of man. The Catholic Church found a midway by stating that the dignity not only comes from God but also from reason.

Human dignity is also present in political philosophy. In the French Revolution the term 'dignities' was used to convey a message of equality. The Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen (1789) states: "all citizens, being equal in the eyes of the law, are equally eligible to all dignities and to all public positions and occupations, according to their abilities, and without distinction except that of their virtues and talents", illustrating human dignity not in relation to God or reason, but in relation to equality. From then onwards, human dignity or dignity surfaced more frequently in political discourse. "The concept of dignity came to be used as a rallying cry for a variety of other social and political movements advocating specific types of social reform during the 19th century" (McCrudden, 2008). After the Second World War human dignity returned to the political arena yet again, mostly in reaction to the Nazi atrocities of the Third Reich. From that moment onwards human dignity was used for European integration, even though that might not have been the goal from the start. However, it seems that the adoption of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, in which human dignity is described, did play a role in the European unification process.

The Permanent Observer of the Holy See to the UN, Celestino Migliore, stated in 2003 on the fifty-fifth Anniversary of the promulgation and adoption of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights that: "When we examine the Charter, we come to realize all the more the nexus between the United Nations Organization and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, one of the most precious and important documents in human history. The medieval canon lawyers and the gallant legal commentators of the sixteenth-century like Vitoria and Suárez had already developed precedents for the basic principles of human rights that flow from the primacy and dignity of the human person." (Migliore, 2003). Migliore argues that there are precedents between Christian thinking and the Human Rights Charter. However, the UN has

been unwilling to state in the Charter that it is based on Christian values. This could be due to the fact that the Charter is for every human in the world, not only Christians. When stating it is based on Christian values, people who are not Christian could have difficulties with this preposition.

As Catholic teaching argues, man is created in the image of God, man has reason and abilities that animals have not (Cicero), therefore, human beings have immense value and dignity which should not be violated. Furthermore, violating the dignity of humans is not in line with the Declaration and Christian thinking. Although the Declaration of Human Rights does not include that the dignity of humans is rooted in his creation in the image of God, it is inevitable that this predominantly Christian thought might have helped developing the morality of human worth just as Cicero's philosophy helped developing this moral. It is clear that, such as Migliore states, Catholic theorists and philosophers like Francisco de Vitoria and Francisco Suárez, influenced the moral behind the creation of the Declaration. "The Declaration provided not only the inspiration but also the basis for the drafting of the European Convention on Human Rights, which was adopted less than two years later" (Cohen-Jonathan, 1989). This treaty (1950) was drafted by the Council of Europe. Influential thinkers/philosophers, whether it is Cicero, Aquinas, de Vitoria, Suarez, Kant or Wollstonecraft all influenced the image we have, and the founding fathers had, of human dignity. Therefore, without saying that human dignity is a distinctive Christian notion, Christian doctrine could have influenced this image of human dignity, the founding fathers and therefore the European integration process.

6. Reconciliation

Reconciliation is possibly the most important aspect of European integration. After the Second World War it was of vital importance that especially Germany and France would work on their relations. Both countries have been in multiple wars with each other and reconciliation between the two was important. "Without reconciliation, it is indeed impossible to perennially cut off all sources of reviving conflicts and stabilize peaceful relations" (Bar-Siman-Tov, 2004). Therefore, the world and Europe specifically was in need of reconciliation. After more than thousands years of war, France and Germany thought it was time to reconcile. As also mentioned by Van Rompuy: "To me, what makes it so special, is reconciliation. In politics as in life, reconciliation is the most difficult thing. It goes beyond forgiving and forgetting, or simply turning the page'' (van Rompuy). Reconciliation is a typical feature of Christianity, expressed numerous times in scripture, and is one of the cornerstones of Catholicism. Scriptural verses of reconciliation include:

Ephesians 4:32 "Be kind to one another, tenderhearted, forgiving one another, as God in Christ forgave you''.

Corinthians 5:18-21 "All this is from God, who reconciled us to himself through Christ and gave us the ministry of reconciliation: that God was reconciling the world to himself in Christ, not counting people's sins against them. And he has committed to us the message of reconciliation. We are therefore Christ's ambassadors, as though God were making his appeal through us. We implore you on Christ's behalf: Be reconciled to God. God made him who had no sin to be sin for us, so that in him we might become the righteousness of God''.

Romans 5:20 "For if while we were enemies we were reconciled to God by the death of his Son, much more, now that we are reconciled, shall we be saved by his life''.

Colossians 1:20-22 "And through him to reconcile to himself all things, whether on earth or in heaven, making peace by the blood of his cross. And you, who once were alienated and hostile in mind, doing evil deeds, he has now reconciled in his body of flesh by his death, in order to present you holy and blameless and above reproach before him''.

Hebrews 12:14 "Strive for peace with everyone, and for the holiness without which no one will see the Lord''.

Matthew 5:24 "Leave your gift there before the altar and go. First be reconciled to your brother, and then come and offer your gift''.

As stated above, the verses explaining reconciliation, kindness and forgiveness in scripture are abundant. Keeler, Grimbly and Wiggins state: "Reconciliation, also called penance or confession (because it involves disclosing one's sins to a priest), is a sacrament of Healing, along with the sacrament of Anointing of the Sick. Reconciliation is also the sacrament of conversion and forgiveness: It is a turning point for one who has strayed from God through sin, and it confers pardon and peace through the priest's absolution, which is part of the sacrament. Through God's love, a sinner is brought back to union with the Father." (Keeler, Grimbly and Wiggins, 2005, p.128). Keeler, Grimbly and Wiggins continue: "The Sacrament of Reconciliation allows the faithful to experience an interior conversion. Sinners feel sorrowful and repentant, and they respond to grace, which turns them back toward God." (Keeler, Grimbly and Wiggins, 2005, p.129). This illustrates not only the importance of reconciliation in general but also the importance of the sacrament in Catholicism. However, it is important to not see reconciliation as an only Catholic or even a Christian notion. The rules of reconciling simply differ. Importantly, reconciliation and forgiveness are of utmost important in every Christian religion, that influenced the founding fathers of the EU in their personal and professional life and "was their main source of inspiration" (Krijtenburg, 2012).

The architects of European integration: Schuman, Adenauer, de Gasperi, and Monnet used the common values of reconciliation and forgiveness to forge and strengthen a cooperative Europe arguably based on Christian values. The founding fathers "pointed to (western) Europe as the geographical-cultural framework in which the classical tradition and Christian thought had provided the normative framework of European civilization" (Rietbergen, 2006). The President of the Association of the Europe Foundation, Giorgino Salina, stated: "The men (Schuman, Adenauer, de Gasperi) were three Catholic Christians with a great and clear awareness of the common good for which nationalist egoisms must be sacrificed, but also statesmen gifted with great political realism and wide vision" (Giorgino Salina, 2007). This illustrates that the three statesmen, all Catholic, shared this a vision of a cooperative Europe. They were familiar with the value of reconciliation because of their Catholic faith. As Pope John Paul II stated: "How can we underestimate, for example, the fact that in 1951, before beginning the delicate negotiations which would lead to the adoption of the Treaty of Paris, they wished to meet in a Benedictine monastery on the Rhine for meditation and prayer?" (Pope John Paul II, 2003). This illustrates that even if two parties are as far away from each

other as possible, as Germany and France were after the war, there is always some common ground from where cooperation is possible, this common ground might have been the faith the statesman shared.

Reconciliation was arguably inevitable in post Second World War Europe. "To avoid the ever-present danger of recurring chauvinism and nationalism and to foster a sense of European unity, as well as to create a bulwark against Bolshevism, a policy of formal economic and political-military cooperation between the states of non-communist Europe did indeed seem the best solution" (Rietbergen, 2006). Cooperation in military goods (coal and steel) were necessary to recover from the war. However, this cooperation was not only the best solution to prevent another devastating war, it could also have the intention of being able to rebuild the own state.

The 'German problem' as mentioned by French politicians, could perhaps only be solved through economic cooperation. The outcome, peace in Europe, was still the goal. Georges Bidualt, minister of the provisional government of France stated: "the integration of a peaceful Germany in a united Europe, a Europe in which the Germans feel secure in their position, will be able to give up all idea of dominating Europe" (Roy Willis, 1965, p.20). Certainly, the economic cooperation helped to achieve this unity. Connecting the economic interest of the member states through supranational thinking produced an effect which would strengthen the cooperation between the states tremendously: spill-over. The spill-over effect created an incentive to also cooperate in sectors besides the economic sector. Inevitably this spill-over effect helped to form European integration as it is today. However, the common spiritual and cultural heritage of the two nations also played an essential role. "We can say that the so-called common European identity is not only a concept to put people into some kind of common form based on an institutional framework, but this common identity really has some historical background" (Pinterič, 2003). Finally, it is likely that both the influence of Christianity and economic goals contributed to reconciliation.

After the Second World War the mindset of political Europe shifted. "The reconciliation process between France and Germany after the Second World War illustrates the changes in beliefs about goals. From continuous violent conflict and competition emerged new goals for the two societies, which stressed cooperation and common interest. Both nations envisioned the political and economic union of Europe, with a Franco-German pillar as its foundation." (Bar-Tal, 2000). This illustrates that for both France and Germany the mindset of the last

centuries was not viable anymore. Cooperation was needed to prevent another war on the continent. Since coal and steel were of vital importance to battle, Schuman developed the Schuman plan, to integrate the coal and steel industries of Europe, and thereby not giving Germany an opportunity to prepare for war once more. When West-Germany would cooperate and integrate with other (west) European democracies the chance of another European war would slim and European integration would strengthen. The creation of the ECSC was the way to achieve peace in Europe. "The founding fathers were strongly influenced by Catholic values, but their decision had both moral and pragmatic aspects (Feldman, 1999a). By engaging Germany in the European project, France was able to control German growth, while for Germany the reconciliation with France was the only way to find the 'right' place in Western Europe without endangering its security (LeGloannec, 1993: 13-34)" (Heo, 2008). This illustrates that for both Germany as France the reconciliation was necessary.

The before mentioned results make clear that reconciliation was of vital importance for peace building in post Second World War Europe. It is evident that the ECSC was not founded on religious beliefs, but on the idea that war in Europe should not be possible anymore. The architects of this European unification process were committed Catholics and the Christian culture of forgiveness and reconciliation is imbedded in Europe. With the help of the founding fathers, this led to reconciliation, a Christian virtue of major importance. The architects, all men of considerable faith, were acquainted with this virtue, realized its importance, and tried to implement it in Europe. The result is a peaceful Europe, where since the ECSC there have not been any wars between EU member states.

7. Supranational thinking

The third value which has vivid connections with both Christianity and European integration is supranational thinking. The value of supranational thinking was introduced in the Schuman plan, which was signed in 1951 by Belgium, France, West-Germany, Italy, The Netherlands and Luxembourg. However, this is not the first time supranational thinking was observed in Europe.

Faith in general and especially Christianity is supranational. The supranational aspect is evident, because faith does not recognize state frontiers. A short overview of European history will illustrate this observation. At the time of the vast Roman Empire, stretching at some point (100 AD) from Judea to England, there were many different 'religious' phenomena. "The Empire, because of its expansionist politics, also embraced a multitude of religions'' (Rietbergen, 2006). These religions varied greatly, with many different deities, but many Romans were religious. "For ordinary Romans, religion was part of daily life'' (Rüpke, 2007). This included many sects, monotheistic and polytheistic. In the course of a century however, "Christianity spread and became a dominant religion in the Empire'' (MacMullen, 1984). This had two reasons. Firstly, early Christianity incorporated many aspects of other sects and therefore appealed to a larger public. Secondly, Paul the apostle, did great work in making sure that this new religion was for everyone. "He preached that Christianity was not only for former Jews but was open to every person'' (Rietbergen, 2006). Paul and his fellow early missionaries traveled all across the empire to deliver this 'good news' to every Roman citizen. The conversion of the Empire was speeded because it was accessible to everyone. Before Christianity was dominant, "religious education was expensive" (Peachin, 2011). Christianity offered the message to everyone. This, together with very appealing aspects of the religion, such as salvation and revelation insured that Christianity grew exponentially. However, it was not all success. Christians did not worship the Emperor, which angered the authorities. "Prosecutions of Christians began, first only the individuals, later the entire religion was deemed illegal'' (Rietbergen, 2006). In the fourth century however, Emperor Constantine ordered that Christians should no longer be prosecuted and that the religion was no longer illegal. "Constantine together with Licinius created the Edict of Milan liberating all religions" (Cruse, 1898). It seems that Constantine favored Christianity, becoming a Christian himself and giving Christian clerics special treatment such as "exemption from compulsory

public service'' (Eusebius, 325). After this decree the organization of the Church grew and in the fifth century the Emperor gave the pope the sole religious power in the empire.

The Church stepped into secularity as well, providing services the state sometimes could not, such as security to people. With its common set of ideas and language, Roman citizens from every conquered region were assimilated in the Roman framework, with Christianity as its dominant religion. However, the Roman empire went into decline. By the second century, the Empire reached its biggest size in history. "In many times of the Roman Empire the expansion of that Empire is what kept it going. However, because the maximum was reached "people started to migrate" (Kinver, 2011). "Citizens formed small tribe like communities and traveled from one place to another" (Rietbergen, 2006). Tribes as the Huns, Goths and Burgundians settled inside and at the frontiers of the Empire. The pressure on the Empire grew vastly and, also because of its size, became difficult to manage against the threats that occurred. "The agricultural sector worsened because of high taxation" (Ferrill, 1986) and the bureaucratic structure of the Empire became evident as it was unable to mobilize. The regions and communities inside the Empire went their own way, "operating as closed systems, providing for all their own needs and did not engage in trade at all" (Bartlett, 1994). Economic decline ensued, "diminishing returns on investments in social complexity" (Tainter, 1988) and epidemics ran free. By the end of the fifth century, under huge amounts of pressure from outside (Barbarian invasions) as well as inside the Empire, Rome fell. However, Christianity remained. Furthermore, not only Christianity remained, the organizational church remained. After the fall of the empire Europe was divided by tribes. However, these tribes remained Christian and the church dictated the teachings. This illustrates the church as a supranational organization, founded on values taken not only from scripture, but also pagan sects and cults. Simply put, Christianity appealed to most citizens in Europe, because the values were common, known and attractive, such as possible salvation for everyone. Christianity was therefore able to survive after the fall of the empire. Soon after leaders of various tribes realized they needed the blessing of the church to remain in power, making the church even more influential. "As the proclaimed heir of Rome, the church brought not only Christian values to the tribes but also more practical skills, such as literacy, organizational/governmental and legislative understanding" (Rietbergen, 2006). In return, the tribes would have to convert, which they did. Throughout history, leaders went to Rome to be crowned by the church, which started the Holy Roman Empire, which would last till Napoleons rule.

In Christian tradition, missionaries have been a major factor in promoting, teaching and spreading Catholicism over the world. Church organizations taught that Christianity must be a common good accessible to every human being. In the dark ages, Europe was divided into many territories governed by many leaders. Catholicism was one of the few similarities between the nations and people. Paganism was effectively nullified in Europe, probably because of severe repercussions for people practicing paganism and the papacy became more important and had greater influence. After the ecclesiastic schism (1054), which had its roots in the fourth and fifth century where, "the separation of the territories became clearer" (Davies, 1998). The papacy and Catholicism were one of the few steadfast institutions at the time, in a continent divided by language, culture and wars. Christianity had become increasingly important, "not only for moral, ethics, and liturgical teaching, but also as the political arena" (Wickham, 2010). Conquistadors brought Catholicism to the 'new world' and evangelized the Americas. Throughout history, supranational thinking was part of Christianity. The morals and ethics spread by the Church still have their stamp on many parts of the world in fields of law (e.g. blasphemy) and political theory (e.g. Christian democracy). This, together with the evangelization of the world, illustrates that Catholicism is a prime example of supranational thinking.

After the Second World War, "European Catholics have favored greater supranational cooperation" (Nelsen, Guth, Highsmit, 2011, p.2). The Church realized it needed to become an institution of dialogue. This European dialogue shifted from a "church-state to church-society" (Himes, 2006). Arguably the new role of the Church would be more advisory than powerful, as an interest group. "in short, the Catholic Church in the postwar period transformed itself into a transnational interest group that could operate at both an international and domestic level" (Warner, 2000). This illustrates that after the Second World War, the Vatican was in favor of a supranational cooperation and European unification although the Church did not want to get involved in temporal matters.

The Catholic Church quickly realized that after the dramatic effects of the Second World War the continent was in need of an institutional body which would surpass national interest. The main reason being peace in Europe. Nelsen, who has studied the influence of religion in politics in Europe extensively, wrote: "In the immediate postwar period the Vatican took special interest in international relations, including the possibility of a politically united Europe" (Nelsen, 2013). It is evident that the Church also hoped for a continent where states could cooperate in brotherhood. After the war the Church advocated a supranational

organization. This view is clearly illustrated by Pope Pius XII (1876-1958) by arguing: "formation of an organ for the maintenance of peace, of an organ invested by common consent with supreme power, to whose office it would also pertain to smother in its germinal state any threat of isolated or collective aggression'' (Pius XII, 1944). "To Pius XII, Catholic universalism and European unity were of the same cloth and he was more than willing to put the considerable power of the papacy over Catholic public opinion behind the cause. The postwar Vatican thus supported in general terms the idea of an integrated Europe. It clearly hoped for a unity grounded in explicitly Christian values, which the pope recognized as universal. And it was willing to back integration efforts rhetorically— no small factor in intensely Catholic communities across Europe. In terms of European integration, the Vatican gave Catholics permission to identify with a united Europe and pursue policies that moved nations toward unity.'' (Nelsen, 2013) This unity could possibly secure the position of Christianity and more specifically Catholicism in Europe. It was clear that a supranational body was of great interest to the church. However, did the church actually influence policy on European integration after the Second World War? According to Nelsen it did, namely: "The process of integrating Europe received early, crucial support from the Catholic Church, and the European Community/Union customarily relied on popes, bishops, lay Catholics, and church-going politicians to help pass periodic treaty revisions and accession agreements'' (Nelsen, 2013). This was specifically Catholic because "Protestant denominations and Lutherans were not in favor of extensive European integration in the beginning and needed to be convinced by Catholics, such as the founding fathers" (Philpott, Shaw, 2006). The reason for the Protestant resistance had its roots in the Reformation. "The Reformation era's civil and international unrest had taught Protestants that the sovereign nation state was the best guarantor of their political, social, and cultural autonomy'' (Nelsen, 2006). The Protestants wanted their security and autonomy not to be infringed, which was what they were scared of when it concerned European integration. This fear of losing autonomy and seeing European integration as a threat could have been the primary reasons for the lack of enthusiasm for the supranational project by Protestants.

The considerable effort shown by Pope Pius XII illustrates the notion that also the Catholic Church desired a peaceful and united Europe and motivated its laity and clergy to embrace this notion. European integration was held in high regard by the Catholic Church and influenced not only clergy but also laity and politicians.

The backing of the church on the European project was important because without this backing from the church politicians and laity alike could have been less eager to move forward with the project. The lack of backing from the Protestants and other denominations might have been less influential because the founding fathers were all Catholic. The supranational nature of the faith (from the Roman Empire to the Holy Roman Empire) might contributed to the supranational thinking of the time and inspired the architects of the European integration process.

8. Subsidiarity

Supranationality does not imply that laws should be similar in every nation. The principle of subsidiary, "literally meaning "to 'seat' ('sid') a service down ('sub') as close to the need for that service as is feasible'' (Hehir, 1998) is one of the key aspects of European integration. The only way the EU can make decisions about certain matters is when the member states previously gave it permission to do so (transfer of power). However, the EU strives to delegate these decisions on the lowest possible level, whether it is national, regional or local. Merely when the lower levels are ineffective to deal with matters, the higher level should become involved.

But where does the principle of subsidiarity come from? Firstly, Romano Prodi, former chair of the European commission (1999- 2004) and former professor at Harvard University believes its roots lie in Catholicism. "Subsidiarity plays an important part in the constitutional structure of the European Union. Although its legal effects may be slight, its symbolic significance is enormous: it is a declaration of the vision of Europe shared by the authors of the Treaty and is enshrined in that document. Its importance is recognized in Romano Prodi's recent book, *Europe as I See It*, where he cites subsidiarity as one of the core principles of governance that reveals the roots and identity of the European Union. For Prodi, subsidiarity is a distinctively Catholic notion, first formulated in papal encyclicals. In fact, he draws attention to this religious connection as part of a call for an appreciation of the 'Christian soul' of Europe.'' (Barber, 2005). Prodi believes that it was a distinctively Catholic notion which was formulated first in the encyclical Quadragesimo anno of Pope Pius XI.

Secondly, Brennan of the Villanova University School of Law agrees with Prodi, stating: "Pius said this in *Quadragesimo anno*, the encyclical that gave the principle of subsidiarity -- a key component of the socio-political order affirmed by the Church in response to the social dissolution wrought by the revolutionaries -- its first, and canonical, formulation in Catholic social doctrine.'' (Brennan, 2012). The social dissolution was the status of the church. "Separation of church and state was becoming increasingly popular throughout Europe and the church needed to respond to this" (Brennan, 2012). The church did so through the principle of subsidiarity. With this response, the church could remain active in fields it was needed, such as care for the poor or helpless.

In short, subsidiarity is a common principle in Catholicism. "Subsidiarity is a uniquely Catholic principle that underlies much of the Church's teaching on social justice issues'' (Vischer, 2001). This principle, now commonly used not only in Catholic or in Christian organizations, is currently also used in the EU in a legal framework. The subsidiarity principle is clearly stated in the Treaty on the European Union article 5 (3)*: Under the principle of subsidiarity, in areas which do not fall within its exclusive competence, the Union shall act only if and in so far as the objectives of the proposed action cannot be sufficiently achieved by the Member States, either at central level or at regional and local level, but can rather, by reason of the scale or effects of the proposed action, be better achieved at Union level* (TEU, art.5 (3)). However, it is important to remember its roots. Pope Pius XI, in his encyclical Quadragesimo anno, explained the importance of subsidiarity. He stated: "It is a fundamental principle of social philosophy, fixed and unchangeable, that one should not withdraw from individuals and commit to the community what they can accomplish by their own enterprise and industry. So, too, it is an injustice and at the same time a grave evil and a disturbance of right order, to transfer to the larger and higher collectivity functions which can be performed and provided for by lesser and subordinate bodies. Inasmuch as every social activity should, by its very nature, prove a help to members of the body social, it should never destroy or absorb them.'' (Pope Pius XI, 1931). This very clearly states the principle of subsidiarity. It illustrates the importance of keeping functions on the lowest possible level.

Scholars agree that subsidiarity has Catholic origins. Vischer states: "Catholicism provides more than an academic explanation of the word's origins; it also provides the historical and theological context that gives the word meaning. To invoke subsidiarity in public policy debates without acknowledging and exploring its Catholic roots is to cut off the principle from the particular priorities it reflects and the broader values it embodies.'' (Vischer, 2001). The principle has evolved from mere Catholic social teaching to the incorporation into the EU legal framework (TEU) it is now. An example of subsidiarity used in Catholic teachings is illustrated by John Paul II, when stating that "private bodies, such as charities and families, are often better care providers than the state'' (Pope John Paul II, 1991). Therefore, care or welfare should be provided by institutions closer to the individual, than to the government. Pope John Paul II stated: "State welfare institutions are often bureaucratic and impersonal, providing only for people's material needs. Mutual bodies, such as trade unions, are defended in instrumentalist terms: they can provide care for their members, and can defend and represent the interests of members'' (Pope John Paul II). Government policy copies this principle, not only in terms of economics (trade unions) but also in healthcare (home care) and even

parenthood (obligation to financially support children so the government does not have to do so).

An example of subsidiarity used in contemporary politics is that certain matters may be decided by national governments instead of the EU. One of the clearest examples is the winter tyres study. "EU could legislate to make winter tyres mandatory for every vehicle in the EU from e.g. December till March. However, when residing in warmer countries like Spain, one generally does not need winter tyres. However, when looking at cold/Nordic countries such as Denmark winter tyres are probably needed" (van den Haspel, 2013). It is therefore more pragmatic and logical to interpret the decision of winter tyres according to each EU member state. Another example of how the subsidiarity principle is used across EU memberstates, is the European legislation on hunting. "The Habitats Directive (92/43/EEC) and the Birds Directive (79/409/EEG) aim to protect certain predators and birds in the member states. The directives aim to ensure that the populations of rare species in the EU are kept stable. However, the populations of specific species differ radically within the EU. Therefore, it is difficult to apply the same directive from Gibraltar to the border of Murmansk." (Nyman, 2007). Thus, animals may be more common in one country or region than in the other. Hence, it does not make sense to create a hunting policy which is the same in the entire EU. It is up to the member states to decide about the quota of hunting.

These are examples of how the subsidiarity principle is used in the EU. The current use of subsidiarity is the same as how Pope Pius XI explained this principle (in Quadragesimo anno). Transfer power and functions is not necessary to higher bodies if these functions can easily be done by the lower level. In the tyres and the hunting examples, the higher body is considered to be the EU whereas the lower body is referred to any EU member state. The EU holds subsidiarity in high regard (by stating it in the treaty) and it is possible to test laws according to the principle to get it amended. Thus, there is no need for a supranational organization such as the EU to decide on matters on which the member states could decide perfectly themselves.

9. Conclusion

This research focused on the connection between Christianity and European integration. It studied four key concepts of the European unification process which are: human dignity, reconciliation, supranational thinking and subsidiarity. Human dignity was defined after the Second World-War in order to permanently avoid the committed atrocities. The result was the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (adopted by the general assembly in 1948). The writings of Catholic theologians like De Vitoria and Suarez influenced the creation of this declaration. The notion of human dignity is a key aspect of Christianity and European political philosophy and influenced the founding fathers of the EU.

Reconciliation is another crucial aspect of European integration. The reconciliation between France and Germany was of vital importance for European peacebuilding; the nations had been sworn enemies for centuries. Reconciliation, is an aspect of high importance in Christianity and may be seen as one of the cornerstones of Catholicism. Robert Schuman, his Catholic background, his attempts for reconciliation since 1919 and his upbringing in a conflicted region explained to a large extent how this Franco-German reconciliation could happen. His background helped him find a way for France and Germany to reconcile based on the common spiritual and cultural heritage and their mutual interest in coal and steel. The Schuman plan was adopted and the European Coal and Steel Community (ECSC) was created. The ECSC ensured that the means of war, coal and steel, would become means of peace. This resulted in member states not going to war against each other and strengthened European integration.

In Christianity supranational thinking has always been an essential aspect. After the fall of the Roman Empire Christianity remained. It adopted many features of the Empire and continued to dominate religious life and culture in Europe for centuries. Furthermore, the importance of spreading the faith is embedded in Christianity. After the Second World War Pope Pius XII was in favor of a supranational organization that would maintain peace on the continent. The ECSC ensured this and the successors maintained it.

By origin, subsidiarity is a Catholic principle. Subsidiarity includes that individuals are still in charge of matters that concern them directly. Pope Pius XI was the first to formulate the subsidiarity principle clearly. In addition, subsidiarity is reflected in politics through decision making on the lowest level possible.

Thus, political decisions may be tested to observe whether or not laws and political actions meet the subsidiarity principle. The EU and its forerunners recognized the value of this principle and continued to implement it in the organization.

All the above mentioned values added to the European Christian embedded culture, helped to strengthen the EU integration. Therefore, it may be argued that Christian thinking had a visible influence on European integration. The result is a continent that managed to prevent any eventual war between its member states after the Second World War. As a consequence, there is increased cooperation on many levels, while the EU developed as a unique supranational organization winning the Nobel Peace Prize.

The influence of Christianity on the European integration is poorly discussed in literature. It would be worthwhile to do further research on the extent of the influence of Christianity within the European integration. Furthermore, research is necessary to determine whether it was a Christian specific influence or whether or not, other (monotheistic) religions could have achieved similar results.

References

St. T. Aquinas, 1265, *Summa theologiae,* Christian classics, 1981

N. W. Barber, 2005, *The Limited Modesty of Subsidiarity,* European Law Journal

Y. Bar-Siman-Tov, 2004, *From conflict resolution to reconciliation,* Oxford University Press

D. Bar-Tal, 2000, *From Intractable Conflict Through Conflict Resolution to Reconciliation: Psychological Analysis,* Political Psychology

B. Bartlett, 1994, *How Excessive Government Killed Ancient Rome,* Cato Journal

P. M. Brennan, 2012, *Subsidiarity in the tradition of Catholic social doctrine*, Villanova University School of Law

H. Cancik, 2001, *Dignity of man,* Kretzmer and Klein

Catechism of the Catholic Church, 1997, Licap- Libreria Editrice Vaticana

Cicero, 44 BC, *De officiis,* Harvard University Press

G. Cohen-Jonathan, 1989, *La Convention européenne des droits l'homme,* Presses universitaires d'Aix-Marseille

G. Davie, 2000, Religion in Modern Europe: A Memory *Mutates*, Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press

N. Davies, *Europe: a History,* Harper Perennial

D. Dinan, 2005, *Ever Closer Union: An Introduction to European Integration*, Lynne Rienner

M. Doyle, 1983, *Kant, Liberal Legacies, and Foreign Affairs,* Wiley, Philosophy and Public Affairs

European Commission, the founding principles of the Union, retrieved on May, 16, 2013, from http://europa.eu/scadplus/constitution/objectives_en.htm#VALUES

Eusebius, 325, *Historia Ecclesiastica,* Translated by C. F. Cruse, 1898, London: Samuel Bagster

Z. Enyedi, J. T. S. Madeley, 2004, *Church and state in Contemporary Europe,* Routledge

L. G. Feldman, 1999, *The Principle and Practice of Reconciliation in German Foreign Policy: Relations with France, Israel, Poland and the Czech Republic*, International Affairs (Royal Institute of International Affairs)

A. Ferrill, 1986, *The Fall of the Roman Empire: the Military Explanation,* New York: Thames and Hudson Ltd.

R. H. Ginsberg, 2007, *Demystifying the European Union: the Enduring Logic of Regional Integration.* Lanham, Rowland and Littlefield Publishers Inc.

D. G. Groody, 2007, *Globalization, spirituality and justice,* Orbis Books, New York

H. Keeler, S. Grimbly, J. B. Wiggins, 2005, *101 things everyone should know about Catholicism,* Adams Media

M. Kinver, 2011, *Roman Rise and Fall Recorded in Trees,* BBC

M. van den Haspel, 2014, Lecture on EU legislation in the Legal Dimension of Europe module

J. B. Hehir, 1998, *Catholic social teaching and the challenge of the future,* WOODSTOCK REP.

C. Henkel, 2002, *The Allocation of Powers within the European Union: A Closer Look at the Principle of Subsidiarity,* Berkely Journal of International Law

Seung-Hoon Heo, 2008, *Reconciling Hereditary Enemy States: Franco-German and South Korean-Japanese Relations in Comparative Perspective,* The Journal of International Policy Solutions

K. R. Himes, O.F.M., 2006, Vatican II and Contemporary Politics, in P. C. Manuel, L. C. Reardon, C. Wilcox, *The Catholic Church and the Nation-State: Comparative Perspectives,* Georgetown University Press

E. Kant, 1795, *Zum ewigen Frieden,* Nabu Press

K. van Kersbergen, B. Verbeek, 1994, *The politics of subsidiarity in the European Union,* Journal of common market studies

M. Krijtenburg, 2012, *Schuman's Europe, his frame of reference,* Leiden university Press

A. LeGloannec, 1993. *France, Germany, and the New Europe*, in Dirk Verheyen & Christian Søe, eds., *The Germans and their Neighbors*. Boulder; San Francisco; Oxford: Westview Press

R. MacMullen, 1984, *Christianizing the Roman Empire, ad 100-400,* New Haven

C. McCrudden, 2008, *Human Dignity and Judicial Interpretation of Human Rights,* The European Journal of International Law Vol. 19 no. 4

C. Migliore, 2003, Intervention by the Holy See at the 58th session of the General Assembly of the United Nations Organization on the occasion of the fifty-fifth anniversary of the universal declaration of human rights, retrieved on October, 7, 2013 from http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/secretariat_state/2003/documents/rc_seg-st_20031210_human-rights_en.html

A. S. Milward, 2000, *The European Rescue of the Nation-State*, London, UK: Routledge.

G. P. della Mirandola, 1486, *De hominis dignitate,* Reclam Phillip Jun.

J. Morsink, 1999, *The Universal Declaration of Human Rights. Origins, Drafting & Intent,* University of Pennsylvania Press

B. F. Nelsen, J. L. Guth, B. Highsmith, 2011, *Does Religion Still Matter?*
Religion and Public Attitudes toward Integration in Europe, Politics and Religion

B. F. Nelsen, 2013, *European integration and the Catholic and Protestant Churches,* Furman University, American Political Science Association

M. Nyman, 2007, *The subsidiarity principle and EU institutions,* IND/DEM

R. Paris, 2004, *At war's end*, Cambridge University Press

M. Peachin, 2012, *The Oxford Handbook of Social Relations in the Roman World,* Oxford University Press

D. Philpott, T.S. Shaw, 2006, *Faith, Freedom and Federation: The Role of Religious Ideas and Institutions in European Political Convergence.* In Religion in an Expanding Europe, eds. T. A. Byrnes, P. J. Katzenstein. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 34–64

J. Pinder, S. Usherwood, 2007, *The European Union,* Oxford University Press

U. Pinterič, 2003, *National and supranational identity in the context of the European integration and globalization*, Faculty of Social Sciences, Ljubljana

Pope John Paul II, 1987, *Sollicitudo rei socialis,* Vatican Publishing House

Pope John Paul II, 1991, *Centesimus annus,* Vatican Publishing House

Pope John Paul II, 2003, addressing European Christian Democratic Politicians

Pope Pius XI, 1931, *Quadragesimo anno,* Vatican Publishing House

Pope Pius XII, 1944, Christmas Allocution of 1944, Vatican Publishing House

H. Van Rompuy, 2012, *Nobel Peace Prize acceptance speech,* retrieved on December, 17, 2012 from
http://www.nobelprize.org/nobel_prizes/peace/laureates/2012/eu-lecture_en.html

P. Rietbergen, 2006, *Europe a cultural history*, Routledge

J. Rüpke, 2007, *Roman religion – religions of Rome*, in *a companion to Roman Religion,* Blackwell, 2007.

Norwegian Nobel Committee, 2012, Nobel Prize Press Release, retrieved on December, 17, 2012 from http://www.nobelprize.org/nobel_prizes/peace/laureates/2012/press.html

R. Sakwa, A. Stevens, 2006, *Contemporary Europe,* Palgrave Macmillan

G. Salina, 2007, *Time to reclaim the EU's heritage,* The Universe

C. Shore, 2000, *Building Europe: The Cultural Politics of European Integration,* Routledge

B. Spinoza, 1670, *Theologico-Political Treatise,* Focus Publishing

J. Tainter, 1988, *The Collapse of Complex Societies,* Princeton University Press

United Nations, The Universal Declaration of Human Rights, retrieved on May, 9, 2014, from http://www.un.org/en/documents/udhr/history.shtml

R. K. Vischer, 2001, *Subsidiarity as a principle of governance: Beyond devolution,* Indiana Law Review

G. Venneri, P. Ferrara. 2009, *Alcide De Gasperi and Antonio Messineo: A Spiritual Idea of Politics and a Pragmatic Idea of Religion?* Religion, State & Society

C. M. Warner, 2000, *Confessions of an Interest Group: The Catholic Church and Political Parties in Europe,* Princeton University Press

F. Roy Willis, 1965, *France, Germany, and the new Europe 1945-1963*, Stanford University Press

C. Wickham, 2010, *The Inheritance of Rome: Illuminating the Dark Ages 400-1000,* Penguin

M. Wollstonecraft, 1790, *A Vindication of the Rights of Men, in a Letter to the Right Honourable Edmund Burke; Occasioned by His Reflections on the Revolution in France,* 1995, Cambridge University Press